

**SUB-REGIONAL HEALTH GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT
OF EBOLA EPIDEMIC IN NIGERIA AND SIERRA LEONE 2014-
2016**

NJOAGUANI, OLUWATOBI ELIZABETH

Matriculation Number: 05AH02169

NOVEMBER, 2020

Mr. Ezekiel Agir (ECOWAS RCSDC), Dr. Oriyomi, Dr. Jimi Awokola, Zainab Conteh (my contact in Sierra Leone, MOHS) amongst others.

Lastly, I am grateful for the support of my family. Thankful to the dearest 'Aunty B,' Mrs. Bridget Njoaguani, and Mr. Francis Njoaguani for getting me all the books I needed from the U.S. for my literature review and my work. Thank you, Uncle, for all your efforts to get me to WAHO. I am grateful. Thank you for providing me a home and a vehicle to use any time I was in Abuja for research. I am super thankful for your support; may God bless you richly. A special thanks to my lovely parents, Elder and Dcns. H.O. Babatunde. I am forever grateful to you, first, for giving me the best of everything and then for your labour and time you took to babysit your grandchildren at times when I was away working or researching. I am eternally grateful to you; I consider you my biggest fans and my unshakable pillar of support. May you both live long to enjoy the fruits of your labour. Then to my husband, Mr. Ikechukwu Njoaguani, my pastor, my lover, and my friend. You are undoubtedly one of the strongest and most secure men I know. Thank you for your support. Thank you for allowing me to reach my dreams and become a better me. Thank you for the push, the moral, emotional, and financial support. Thank you for allowing me to go all week in pursuit of my goals. Thank you for your understanding always. I love you, and thank God for you.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

COVER PAGE	
TITLE PAGE	i
ACCEPTANCE	ii
DECLARATION	iii
CERTIFICATION	iv
DEDICATION	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	x
LIST OF FIGURES	xiv
LIST OF TABLES	xv
LIST OF ABBREVIATION	xvi
ABSTRACT	xxi
CHAPTER ONE : INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background to the Study	1
1.2 Statement of the Problem	7
1.3 Research Questions.....	10
1.4 Objectives of the Study.....	10
1.5 Research Hypotheses.....	11
1.6 Significance of the Study.....	11
1.7 Scope of the Study.....	14
1.8 Definition of Operational Terms	17
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW.....	21
2.1.1 Theory and Practice of Health Diplomacy	21
2.1.2 Sub-regional Health Governance: Conceptual Review	23
2.1.2 Sub-regional Health Governance and the Management of Health/Epidemics .	30
2.1.3 Management of Epidemics- Conceptual Review	37
2.1.4 Management of Infectious Disease Outbreaks: An Empirical Review	40
Ebola Virus Disease.....	43

2.1.5 Sierra Leone before the EVD Outbreak	45
2.1.6 Nigeria before the EVD Outbreak	50
2.1.7 Health in West Africa before the EVD Outbreak.....	52
2.1.8 The Management of the Ebola Virus Disease	55
2.1.9 EVD outbreak in Nigeria.....	67
2.1.9 EVD outbreak in Sierra Leone	69
Gaps in Literature on the EVD Response.....	71
2.2 Theoretical Framework.....	73
2.2.1 The New Sub-regionalism Perspective.....	73
2.2.3 Application of Sub-regional Security Complex Theory	77
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY	79
3.1 Research Design	79
3.1.1 Study Population.....	80
3.1.2 Sampling Technique.....	81
Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria	82
3.1.3 Sample Size	84
3.1.4 Sources of Data.....	85
3.1.7 Technique for Data Analysis	86
3.1.6 Ethical Consideration	90
3.1.7 Reliability and Validity of Instrument.....	91
CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS	93
4.1 Data Presentation.....	93
4.1.1 Database Search Strategy	94
4.1.2 Search Result for Nigeria and PRISMA Diagram.....	95
4.1.3 Search Result for Sierra Leone and PRISMA Diagram	97
4.1.4 Interviews	99
4.2 Data Analysis.....	99
Framework Analysis for EVD Management in Nigeria.....	100
i. Policy Guidance	100
ii. Intelligence and Oversight	101
iii. Collaboration and Coalition Building	104

iv. System Design	106
v. Accountability	110
Framework Analysis for EVD Management in Sierra Leone	111
I. Policy Guidance	111
ii. Intelligence and Oversight	114
iii. Collaboration and Coalition Building	117
iv. System Design	121
V. Accountability.....	124
Social Network Analysis	124
A. Social Network Analysis for Nigeria.....	125
Social Network Analysis for Sierra Leone	138
4.4. Summary of Findings	144
CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION.....	149
5.1 Research Hypothesis One	149
5.2 Research Hypothesis Two	153
5.3 Research Hypothesis Three	155
5.4 Research Hypothesis Four	156
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	164
6.1 Summary.....	164
6.2 Conclusion	166
6.3 Contributions to Knowledge.....	168
6.4 Recommendations	169
6.5 Limitations of the Study	171
6.6 Suggestions for Further Research.....	172
REFERENCES.....	174
A- PubMed Search Result for Nigeria.....	195
Appendix B- ScienceDirect Search Result for Nigeria	196
Appendix C- PubMed Search Result for Sierra Leone.....	197
Appendix D-Science Direct Search Result for Sierra Leone	198
Appendix E- Nodes List for Nigeria.....	199
Appendix F-Nodes List and Attribute (Nigeria).....	200

Appendix G- Nodes list for Sierra Leone	201
Appendix H- Nodes list and Attribute (Sierra Leone).....	202
Appendix H- Interview Guide	203

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Description	Page
3.1	Analytical Framework for Assessing the Sub-regional Response of the	77
4.1	PRISMA diagram of Systematic Review of Nigeria EVD response	100
4.2	PRISMA diagram of Systematic Review of Sierra Leone EVD response	101
4.3	Organisational Structure of the EEOC	112
4.4	Directional Node Network for Containing EVD In Nigeria	132
4.5	Nodes Network Indicating Actor Attribute (Types)	134
4.6	Nodes Network Indicating Actor Attribute (Area of Collaboration)	135
4.7	Hierarchical Clustering of Equivalence Matrix	137
4.8	Nodes Network for Containing EVD in Sierra Leone	143
4.9	Nodes Network Indicating Actor Attribute (Types)	144
4.10	Nodes Network Indicating Actor Attribute (Area of Collaboration)	14

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Description	Page
2.1	List of Interviews Conducted	75
2.2	An Overview of the Research Methods	82
4.1	Outdegrees Statistics for Nigeria	139
4.2	In degrees statistics (A)	140
4.3	In Degree statistics (B)	141
4.4	In Degree Statistics (C)	141
4.5	In Degree Statistics (D)	142
4.6	In Degree Statistics (E)	142
4.7	Outdegree statistics for Sierra Leone	146
4.8	Sierra Leone Indegree Statistics (A)	147
4.9	Sierra Leone Indegrees Statistics C	147

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACDC	Africa Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
ACHEST	African Centre for Global Health and Social Transformation
AENHN	African Essential National Health Network, African Field Epidemiology Network
AFENET	Africa Field Epidemiology Network
AFHEA	African Health Economics and Policy Association
AfMA	Africa Medical Association
Africa MNCH	Africa Coalition on Maternal, Newborn and Child Health
AFRICASO	African Council of AIDS Service Organisations
AfriComNet	African Network for Strategic Communication in Health and Development
AFRIYAN	African Youth and Adolescents Network
AFRO	WHO Sub-regional Office for Africa
AFRO-NETS	African Networks for Health Research & Development
AGPMPN	Association of General and Private Medical Practitioners of Nigeria
AHS	African Health Strategies
ALIMA	Alliance for International Medical Action
AMCs	Academic Medical Centers
AMOHN	Association of Medical Officers of Health in Nigeria
AMREF	African Medical and Research Foundation
AMRO	World Health Organisation Sub-regional Office for the Americas
APHPN	Association of Public Health Physicians of Nigeria
APHRC	African Population and Health Research Center
ASCC	ASEAN Socio-Cultural Community (ASCC) Blueprint
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations

AU-ASEOWA	African Union – African Support to EVD Outbreak in West Africa
CAFS	Centre for African Studies
CANTAM	Central Africa Network on Tuberculosis, HIV/AIDS and Malaria
CAR	Central African Republic
CCC	Community Care Centre
CDC	Center for Disease Control and Prevention
CEFOREP	Centre Régional de Formation, de Recherche et de Plaidoyer en Santé de la Reproduction
CERF	Central Emergency Response Fund
CERPOD	Centre d’Etudes et de Recherche sur la Population pour le Développement
CES	Centre for Epidemiological Surveillance
CESAG	Centre Africain d'Etudes Supérieures en Gestion
CHESTRAD	Centre for Health Sciences Training, Research and Development
CHREC	Covenant University Health Research Ethics Committee
CHWs	Community Health Workers
COHRED	Council on Health Research for Development
COVID-19	Coronavirus Disease 2019
DART	USAID's Disaster Assistance Response Team
DFID	Department for International Development (U.K.)
DNOS	Disease Notification Officers (DNOs)
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
DSNOs	Disease Surveillance and Notification Officers
EAIDSNet	East African Integrated Disease Surveillance Network
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African State
EDPL	Emerging and Dangerous Pathogens Laboratory Network
EEOC	EVD Emergency Operations Centre
EMRO	WHO Sub-regional Office for the Eastern Mediterranean

EOC	Emergency Operations Centre
ESAMI	Eastern and Southern African Management Institute
ETC	EVD Treatment Centre
ETU	EVD Treatment unit
EU	European Union
EURO	WHO Sub-regional Office for Europe
EVD	Ebola Virus Disease
FCTC	Framework Convention of Tobacco Control
GAVI	Global Alliance for Vaccines and Immunisation
GOARN	Global Outbreak Alert and Response Network
GPEI	The Global Polio Eradication Initiative
HEFAMAA	Health Facility Monitoring and Accreditation Agency
HSS	Health System Strengthening
IASC	Inter-Agency Standing Committee
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
IHD	International Health Directorate
IHR	International Health Regulations
IMC	International Medical Corps
IMS	Incidence Management System
INDEPTH	The International Network for the Demographic Evaluation of Populations and Their Health
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organisation
IOPH	International Office of Public Hygiene
IPC	Infection Prevention and Control
IRC	International Rescue Committee
ISB	International Sanitary Bureau
ISED	Institut de Santé et Développement

**SUB-REGIONAL HEALTH GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT
OF EBOLA EPIDEMIC IN NIGERIA AND SIERRA LEONE (2014-
2016)**

BY

NJOAGUANI, OLUWATOBI ELIZABETH

(05AH02169)

B.Sc, International Relations, Covenant University, Ota

M.Sc, International Relations, Covenant University, Ota

**A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE SCHOOL OF POSTGRADUATE STUDIES IN
PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE AWARD OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY (Ph.D) IN INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS IN THE
DEPARTMENT OF POLITICAL SCIENCE AND INTERNATIONAL
RELATIONS, COLLEGE OF LEADERSHIP DEVELOPMENT STUDIES,
COVENANT UNIVERSITY, OTA, NIGERIA.**

NOVEMBER, 2020

MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MERS	Middle East Respiratory Syndrome
MRU	Mano River Union
MSF	Médecins Sans Frontières
NCDC	The Nigerian Centre for Disease Control
NCDs	Non-Communicable Diseases
NERC	National EVD Response Centre
NFELTP	Nigerian Field Epidemiology and Laboratory Training Program
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NRA	New Sub-regionalism Approach
NSTOP	Nigerian Stop Polio Program
NTA	Nigeria Television Authority
OCHA	United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
OCV	Oral Cholera vaccination
ODK	Open Data Kit
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
OEVD	Occupational EVD
OFDA	Office of U.S. Foreign Disaster Assistance
ONR	Overview of Needs and Requirements
PAHO	Pan-American Health Organisation
PHC	Primary Health Care
PPD ARO	Partners in Population and Development Africa Sub-regional Office
PPE	Personal Protective Equipment
PRISMA	Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses
RCQHC	Sub-regional Center for Quality of Health Care
RCSDC	Sub-regional Centre for Surveillance and Disease Control

RCST	Sub-regional Security Complex Theory
RVSG	Rivers State Government
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SARS	Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome
SEARO	WHO sub-regional offices in South- East Asia (SEARO)
SMAC	Social Mobilisation Action Consortium
SNA	Social Network Analysis
SPHPN	Society of Public Health Professionals of Nigeria
STEPP	STOP the outbreak, TREAT the infected, ENSURE essential s services, PRESERVE stability and PREVENT outbreaks in c ountries currently unaffected
STRIVE	Sierra Leone Trial to Introduce a Vaccine Against EVD
UN	United Nations
UNAIDs	Joint United Nations Programmed on HIV/AIDS
UNASUR	Union of South American Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNMEER	United Nations Mission for EVD Emergency Response
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VHF	Viral Haemorrhagic Fever
WAHO	West African Health Organisation
WASH	Water, Sanitation and Hygiene
WFP	World Food Programme
WHA	World Health Assembly
WHO	World Health Organisation
WPRO	Sub-regional Office for the Western Pacific

ABSTRACT

The year 2014 was a defining year in terms of infectious disease outbreak in West Africa and the world. The Ebola Virus Disease (EVD) 2014 outbreak that began in Guinea became a regional epidemic spreading across the sub-region and beyond. Despite the global awareness and attention that trailed the 2014 EVD outbreak, the effect and impact were felt predominantly at the level. This has prompted this study to evaluate the state of the sub-regional response to the outbreak amidst global response. This inquiry is necessary because of the peculiarity of the sub-region, which houses several countries with the worse Human Development Index (HDI), complemented with weak health systems, significantly porous and poorly governed borders amongst other sub-regional traits. These are key amongst the factors that made the EVD epidemic to thrive in the sub-region. Theoretical justifications also exist for a sub-regional level of analysis of the outbreak, based on the theoretical assumption of the New sub-regionalism theories/Approach. One of which is the Sub-regional Security Complex Theory (RCST) adopted in this study. The theorists postulate that proximity is a factor in the spread of risk factors and that security risks travel faster within short distances than longer ones. To achieve the objectives, the study adopted an ex post facto research design. It included a systematic review of documentary sources and reports as well as a series of in-depth interviews in both Sierra Leone and Nigeria. Furthermore, a framework analysis based on the World Health Organisation (WHO) health system strengthening framework and Social Network Analysis (SNA) was also conducted to demonstrate actor ties, roles, and collaborations. The results revealed that there was a deluge of actors who were involved in the EVD response with varying degrees of collaborations. The prominent sub-regional organisations and partnerships include the African Union Support to Ebola Outbreak in West Africa (ASEOWA) and the West African Health Organisation (WAHO). They have hitherto been charged with the responsibility to coordinate and collaborate in response to health issues did not play significant roles. The ASEOWA, which was the preeminent institution of sub-regional partnership, scored 0 out of 38 possible connections in the outdegree statistics conducted in Nigeria and just 3 out of 31 possible connections in Sierra Leone. The findings indicate that the level and nature of sub-regional governance during the EVD outbreak was significantly low and inadequate. The quality of the response was tilted more towards dependency than cooperation. It is recommended that the sub-regional platforms be strengthened to build more effective and efficient capacities for early warning and response at the sub-regional level.

Keywords: Disease Control, Ebola Virus Disease, Health Governance, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Sub-regionalism

ACCEPTANCE

This is to attest that this thesis is accepted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) in International Relations in the Department of Political Science and International Relations, College of Leadership Development Studies, Covenant University, Ota.

Mr. John A. Philip
(Secretary, School of Postgraduate Studies)

.....
Signature and Date

Prof. Obinna C. Nwinyi
(Acting Dean, School of Postgraduate Studies)

Signature and Date

DECLARATION

I, **NJOAGUANI, OLUWATOBI ELIZABETH (05AH02169)**, declare that this research work was conducted by me under the supervision of Prof. Sheriff F. Folarin of the Department of Political Science and International Relations, College of Leadership and Development Studies, Covenant University, Ota, Nigeria and Dr. Olajumoke Yacob-Haliso of the Department of Political Science and Public Administration, Veronica Adeleke School of Social Sciences, Babcock University, Ogun State, Nigeria. I attest that the thesis has not been presented either wholly or partially for the award of any degree elsewhere. All sources of data used in this thesis are duly acknowledged.

NJOAGUANI, OLUWATOBI ELIZABETH

.....
Signature and Date


CERTIFICATION

We certify that the thesis titled " **Sub-regional Health Governance and Management of Ebola Epidemic: A Study of Nigeria and Sierra Leone 2014-2016**" is an original work conducted by **NJOAGUANI, OLUWATOBI ELIZABETH (05AH02169)**, of International Relations programme in the Department of Political Science and International Relations, College of Leadership Development Studies, Covenant University, Ota, Ogun State, Nigeria under the supervision of Prof Sherrif F Folarin and Dr. Olajumoke Yacob-Haliso. We have examined the work and found it acceptable as part of the requirements for the award of a degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) in International Relations.

Prof. Sheriff F. Folarin
(Supervisor)

.....
Signature and Date

Dr. Olajumoke Yacob-Haliso
(Co-supervisor)


.....
Signature and Date

Prof. Sheriff F. Folarin
(Head, Department of Political Science
and International Relations)

.....
Signature and Date

Prof. Okechukwu M. Ikeanyibe
(External Examiner)

.....
Signature and Date

Prof. Obinna C. Nwinyi
(Acting Dean, School of Postgraduate Studies)

.....
Signature and Date

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to God, the source of my inspiration, and my ever-present help. It is also for the health and wealth of the continent of Africa.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First, I am most grateful to God, the source, and sustainer for the completion of this research work. I remember how He inspired me to change gear to global health issues, and He brought the right people and materials to support me along the road. I am grateful for how He sustained me through the process. I almost gave up on the work many times, but the Alpha and Omega sustained me through and through. He gave me the strength. Many times, I will call out to him as the "author and finisher," and He always came through for me. He granted me favour and victory in every place. Thank you, heavenly Father.

Secondly, my appreciation goes to the Chancellor, my father, and mentor of over 25 years. I am grateful for the privilege to have joined this great commission early. I am thankful for the wisdom I have garnered from your teachings all through this year. I am grateful that you yielded to God's call to set the pace for excellence in education. I was privileged to be one of the pioneer students of Faith Academy, a proud student of Covenant University, and now a doctoral student at this same university. It has been great learning, growing, and pruning process for me. God bless you more and more.

I sincerely appreciate the management of Covenant University under the able leadership of the Vice Chancellor, Prof. Abiodun H. Adebayo and Dr. Olusegun P. Omidiora, the Registrar. I appreciate Prof. Obinna C. Nwinyi, the Acting Dean, School of Postgraduate Studies and all the team of the School of Postgraduate Studies. I also appreciate Prof. Olujide Adekeye (Dean, College of Leadership and Development Studies), whom I thank for his support and insight on my work.

A special thanks to my academic father, who doubles as both my Supervisor and the Head of Department, Political Science and International Relations, Prof. Sheriff Folarin. Thank you for mentoring me over the years, sir, and for your thorough review of my work. Thank you for all your support in my academic journey. You inspire me a whole lot, sir. Thank you for always going the extra mile for me and for always sharing in my celebrations. You are a good father. I am also grateful to Dr. Yacob-Haliso who served as Co-supervisor for my thesis. Thank you, madam, for making working with you so easy. Thank you for being flexible and for always making out time to interact with me. I am grateful for the value that you both brought to my work. I could not have prayed for a better team of supervisors.

I would also like to appreciate Prof. Daniel E. Gberevbie, for his jots of wisdom and inspiration that I have the privilege to receive. Thank you, sir, for all your insight and support throughout the period. I am grateful to Dr. Davies Adeloye, the first co-supervisor for my thesis. I thank him for all I learned from him about the health system, systematic reviews, and Social Network Analysis (SNA). You taught me so much about health governance in such a short period. I appreciate Prof. Peyibomi Soyinka-Airewele, for stirring up my interest in health politics and the long conversations we had on this topic. Thanks to her for helping me to put my thoughts together and to focus on what was important.

Thank you so much to Dr. Ibietan for being a part of this journey, sir. I am grateful to my college examiner, Dr. Azuh Dominic, for the contributions to the work. Then, to Dr. Imhonopi (college examiner), who thoroughly reviewed my work several times and always

stopped to give a word of encouragement. I have learned so much about writing from you, sir. Thank you. I appreciate Dr. Olaseinde (P.G. representative and examiner) for all her insight on the epidemiology of the EVD. Thank you for your support.

I appreciate the critical review and support of the following scholars in the department: Dr Samuel Oni (the honourable, P.G. departmental coordinator, thank you sir for your selflessness and your help), Dr. Patrick Assibong (thank you for your words and support with teaching and grading when you were here), Dr. Moses Duruji, Dr. Joshua Alabi (thank you for all the materials and links sir), Dr Felix Chidozie (thank you specially for your MSc thesis sir and your consideration at the exam office), Dr. Kester Onor (thank you for your prayers and support with our course IRL417) Dr Fadeke Olu-owolabi (I cherish your words of advice ma) Dr. Lady Yartey (my own sister and friend, thank you for always asking about the work), Dr. Faith Olanrewaju (thank you sister for your support on publication and completion), Dr. Popoola (thank you for always pushing for completion), Mrs. Udoh (thank you for your words of encouragement), Dr. Abasilim (for your thorough review and help with publications), Dr. Muyiwa Ajayi (for our talks on Ebola), Mr Ilemobola, Mr. Ejiro Loromeke, Mr Adekunle Olanrewaju, Mr Trust Ayodele, Mr. Gideon, Mr Seyi Ogunowo, Mr Dehinde Gideon and our dearest Administrative officer, Mrs Ochim, I appreciate you.

I met a lot of great people in the course of the fieldwork. I am grateful for and to the following persons: Mr. Abbass (Ministry of Health, Abuja), Mr. Segilola (S.A., Ministry of Health, Abuja), Mr. Obasanya(NCDC), Mr. Durojaiye (MOH), Mrs. Badmus (MOH), Prof. Isiaka Sombie (WAHO), Mrs. Ojuolape Solanke (Liasion officer, WAHO, Nigeria),