

**CITIZENS' PARTICIPATION AND NIGERIA'S PRIMARY
HEALTHCARE POLICY IMPLEMENTATION IN OGUN
STATE (2009-2019)**

**ADEOLA I. OYEYEMI
MATRIC NUMBER: 13PAJ00584**

FEBRUARY, 2021

**CITIZENS' PARTICIPATION AND NIGERIA'S PRIMARY
HEALTHCARE POLICY IMPLEMENTATION IN OGUN STATE
(2009-2019)**

By

ADEOLA I. OYEYEMI

(13PAJ00584)

**B.A., Political Science, University of Minnesota-Twin Cities, Minnesota,
USA**

**M.A., Health and Human Service Administration, Saint Mary's
University of Minnesota, Minnesota, USA**

**A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE SCHOOL OF POSTGRADUATE
STUDIES IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR
THE AWARD OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY (Ph.-D) DEGREE IN
PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION IN THE DEPARTMENT OF POLITICAL
SCIENCE AND INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS, COLLEGE OF
LEADERSHIP AND DEVELOPMENT STUDIES, COVENANT
UNIVERSITY, OTA, NIGERIA**

FEBRUARY, 2021

ACCEPTANCE

This is to attest that this thesis is accepted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) in Public Administration in the Department of Political Science and International Relations, College of Leadership and Development Studies, Covenant University, Ota.

| **Mr. John A. Philip**
(Secretary, School of Postgraduate Studies) Signature and Date

| **Prof. Akan B. Williams**
.....
| (Dean, School of Postgraduate ~~Studies~~—Studies) Signature and
Date

DECLARATION

I, **ADEOLA I. OYEYEMI (13PAJ00584)** declare that this research was carried out by me under the supervision of Prof. Daniel E. Gberevbie and ~~Dr. Olajide I.~~ Ibieta of the Department of Political Science and International Relations, College of Leadership and Development Studies, Covenant University, Ota, Ogun State. I attest that the thesis has not been presented either wholly or partially for the award of any degree elsewhere. All sources of data and scholarly information used in this thesis are duly acknowledged.

Commented [DA1]: Check this name vs the way it is written in the next page.

ADEOLA I. OYEYEMI

.....

Signature and Date

CERTIFICATION

We certify that the thesis titled **Citizens' Participation and Nigeria's Primary Healthcare Policy Implementation in Ogun State 2009-2019** is an original work conducted by **OYEYEMI, ADEOLA I. (13PAJ00584)**, in the Department of Political Science and International Relations, College of Leadership and Development Studies, Covenant University, Canaanland, Ota, Ogun State, Nigeria under the supervision of Prof. Daniel E. Gberevbie and ~~Dr.~~ Dr. Olajide I. Ibieta. We have examined and found this thesis acceptable as part of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.-D) in Public Administration.

Prof. Daniel E. Gberevbie
~~(Supervisor)~~ Supervisor
Signature and Date

.....

~~Dr.~~ Dr. Olajide I. Ibieta
.....
(Co-Supervisor)

Signature and Date

Prof. Daniel E. Gberevbie
(Head, Department of Political Science
and International Relations)

.....

Signature and Date

Prof. Sola Fajana
External Examiner

.....

Signature and Date

| **Prof. Akan B. Williams**

.....

(Dean, School of Postgraduate Studies)

Signature and Date

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to The Alpha and Omega and Waymaker, who saw me from the beginning to the end of this programme. Not by my strength but by God's constant mercy and faithfulness. I also dedicate this thesis to My mother, My Forever Angel, Mrs Funmilola Titilawo Oyeyemi; I thank God for your life.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I must appreciate the support of a number of people who made this thesis possible. First and foremost is my heartfelt and humble gratitude to the Lord Above, My Provider and Protector, for his sufficient love over me and for giving me the strength and ability to complete this thesis.

I want to acknowledge and thank the visionary Chancellor and Chairman, Board of Regents of Covenant University, ~~Dr.~~ [Dr.](#) David O. Oyedepo, for his acceptance and dedication to the work of God in his life. He took up the banner of raising a new generation of leaders for world exploits. May the oil of anointing never depart from you, sir.

I wish to acknowledge the Management of Covenant University for providing the environment for research and learning which aided my completion of this study under the leadership of the Vice-Chancellor Prof. Abiodun H. Adebayo, the Registrar ~~Dr.~~ [Dr.](#) Olusegun P. Omidiora, and Chaplain Pastor Kayode Martins, whose timely words and prayers always come from the altar of God. Everyone working towards the fulfilment of this great institution's vision, God bless you.

I wish to recognize the leadership of the Dean of Postgraduate School, Prof. Akan B. Williams and the Sub-Dean, ~~Dr.~~ [Dr.](#) Emmanuel Amoo in ensuring the smooth progress of the school towards excellence. ~~I recognise and appreciate the time, effort and guidance of the former Acting Dean of Postgraduate School, Prof. Obinna C. Nwinyi, in ensuring the organisation and success of my thesis. Sir, I am grateful. I~~ also acknowledge the support of the Dean of College of Leadership and Development

Studies, Prof. Olujide A. Adekeye, for his presence and commitment to all good things. ~~To my Departmental Postgraduate Coordinators, who in their various ways, have helped to make this work possible, I say thank you. I appreciate the current coordinator, Dr Samuel O. Oni, for his effort, and promptness which cannot be overstated. His predecessors, Dr Segun Joshua and Dr Felix Chidozie, I am most obliged to have had all of you on this journey. Thank you all for your service.~~

This thesis could not have attained completion without the constant and persistent mentorship of my supervisors. ~~First gratitude goes to my principal supervisor who also serves as the Head of Department, Prof. Daniel E. Gberevbic, Public Administration expert. My heartfelt appreciation for being constant, faithful, patient, and resourceful throughout this programme journey. It was not easy, but from day one he has been by my side being a voice of reason and challenge: my guidance, my mentor and academic father throughout my Covenant University stay. Words are not enough to show my appreciation, Sir. Thank You. I am Prof. Daniel E. Gberevbic (Main Supervisor) and Dr Jide Ibietan (Co Supervisor). First to my principal supervisor, now Head of Department, Prof. Daniel Gberevbic, Public Administration expert, my heartfelt gratitude for being constant, faithful, patient, and resourceful throughout this programme journey. It was not easy, but from day one he has been by my side, being a voice of reason and challenge, my mentor and academic father throughout my Covenant University stay. Words are not enough to show my appreciation, Sir. Thank You. Equally beholden to is my co-supervisor, DrDr. Ola Jjide I. Ibietan, for his calmness, meticulous attention to details that sometimes leaves me in awe at his consistency and knowledge. I will not be exaggerating to tout his invaluable contributions to the success of this research. I must say if there are any shortcomings in this thesis, it is my sole doing. My fervent prayers for both of you is that the Almighty God continue to bless you, enrich you and make your paths shinier and brighter unto the perfect dawn (Amen).~~

Commented [DA2]: Prof Daniel E. Gberevbic?

Commented [DA3]: Prof Daniel E. Gberevbic?

With a thankful heart, I appreciate the former Head of Department of Political Science and International Relations, Prof. Sheriff F. Folarin, an erudite scholar; who from the commencement of my academic/research journey to the end, has been there to see this day. Sir, for your continued support, encouragement, and assistance throughout my research and academic career journey, I thank you. The Lord God will continue to bless you and make you the progressive man of valor that you are.

To my Departmental Postgraduate Coordinators, who in their various ways, have helped to make this work possible, I say thank you. I appreciate the current coordinator, Dr. Samuel O. Oni, for his effort and promptness which cannot be overstated. His predecessors, Dr. Segun Joshua and Dr. Felix Chidozie, I am most obliged to have had all of you on this journey. Thank you all for your service.

I am appreciative for my present and past colleagues in the Department of Political Science and International Relations, who came through with their diverse expertise. First, I acknowledge the pleasure of tutelage and friendship with the late Prof. Kunle Amuwo and ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Bankole Olorunyomi of blessed memory. Their lovely memories live on and may their soul rest in peace. In no prejudicial order, I appreciate ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Oluyemi Fayomi, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Moses Duruji, ~~Dr. Samuel Oni~~, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Segun Joshua, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Patrick Assibong, ~~Dr. Felix Chidozie~~, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Fadeke Owolabi, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Kester Onor, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Lady Yartey Ajayi, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Rosemary Popoola, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Faith Olanrewaju, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Muyiwa Ajayi, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Ugochukwu Abasilim (you are very much appreciated for your germane input and sacrifice, May God replenish you abundantly), ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Ilemobola Olanrewaju, Mr. Adekunle Olanrewaju, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Oluwakemi Udoh, ~~Dr. Dr.~~ Oluwatobi Njoaguani, Mrs. Nchekwube Excellence-Oluye, Mr. Ejiro Loromeke, Mr. Olaniyi Ayodele, Mr. Gideon Folorunso, Mr. Oluwatimilehin Deinde-Adedeji, and Mr. Seyi Ogunnowo, you are blessed and favourably treasured. I cannot end my departmental appreciation without recognising the tireless hard work and cooperation of our office support staffs who ensured the smooth operation of all of us and our paperwork in

the persons of Mrs. Modupe Ochim, Ms. Favour Ajayi, Mr. Yomi Ogundare, Mrs. Bukola Jacob. The grace of God is sufficient for you.

Also are the many scholars whose inputs and contributions in one way or the other has made this thesis possible: late Prof. Aize Obayan (1st substantive Vice-Chancellor of Covenant University), Prof. Patience Akpan-Obong, Prof. Charles K. Ayo (3rd substantive Vice-Chancellor of Covenant University), Prof. Aderemi A. Atayero (4th substantive Vice-Chancellor of Covenant University). I recognise and appreciate the time, effort and guidance of the former Acting Dean of Postgraduate School, Prof. Obinna C. Nwinyi, in ensuring the organisation and success of my thesis. Sir, I am grateful. ~~Dr.~~ Deborah Motilewa, you are wonderfully recognised for your advice, encouragement, checkups and friendship, thank you. My research assistant, Mr. Emmanuel Oluyode and many analysts represented by Mr. Oluwatobi Idowu for tirelessly making themselves available whenever I am in need. May favour continually follow you all.

I want to appreciate all the staff, management and citizens of the sampled local government areas and their primary healthcare facilities: Abeokuta South, Ewekoro, Ifo, Odeda, Ijebu North, Ijebu North East, Remo North, Sagamu, Ado-Odo Ota, Imeko-Afon, Ipokia, Yewa South. And to the Medical Officer of Health in Ado-Odo Ota, special thanks to ~~Dr.~~ Bakare for his resourcefulness and Ado-Odo Ota Health Educator, Mr. Fakoya, for his advice and assistance in reaching all my sampled areas, consistently providing necessary information for the success of this thesis.

Finally, but not least, my heartfelt appreciation and love for my family whose presence, love, and support cannot be overlooked. Starting with my father, who suggested this educational journey, my constant prayers goes to Kabiyesi (Oloba) of Oba-Ile, Adekunle Asamu Oyeyemi, Ph.D (Tewogbade 1). Words fail me, but I will say this much, I thank you for your love, support and teachings, as well as the good deeds and values you have deposited in my life. May mercy follow you; may favour

be your friend and long life in good health be your reward for all your hard work. The Olori of Oba-Ile, Mummy Agnes Adediwura Oyeyemi, I thank you for believing in me always, your heartfelt prayers, encouragement and support throughout this journey. Indeed, you are a mother. I pray that the Lord continue to bless and keep you long in good health and peace to enjoy the fruits of your labour. To my lovely siblings in whom I am well pleased. I could not have asked for better brothers than you; the motivators behind my [e-drive](#). Thank you, Lord. They are ever ready with jokes, caring thoughts, support, checkups, and always encouraging. God knows in his perfect wisdom why we are. Thank you Adeyemi O. Oyeyemi and Abioye A. Oyeyemi.

There are still so many others who in one way or the other have been a source of assistance to me throughout this journey, but time and space will not allow me to list all. Just know that you are well thought of and valued. As you have All been there for me, God shall also be there for you even before you ask. Amen.

Father God, to You alone be all the Glory.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENT	PAGE
COVER PAGE	
TITLE PAGE	ii
ACCEPTANCE	iii
DECLARATION	iv
CERTIFICATION	v
DEDICATION	vi

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	xi
LIST OF TABLES	xvi
LIST OF FIGURES	xviii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xix
LIST OF APPENDICES	
xxi	
ABSTRACT	xxii
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background to the Study	1
1.2 Statement of the Problem	6
1.3 Research Questions	9
1.4 Objectives of the Study	9
1.5 Research Hypotheses	10
1.6 Significance of the Study	10
1.7 Scope of the Study	13
1.8 Organisation of the Study	14
1.9 Operational Definition of Terms	16
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	17
2.0 Preamble	17
2.1 The Concept of Public Policy	17
Types of Public Policy	20
Public Policy Process	21
Stages of Policy Process	22
Health Policy	24
2.1.1 Policy Implementation	26
Policy Implementation Instruments	28

— Factors Affecting Policy Implementation	28
— Health Policy Implementation	29
2.1.2 The Concept of Health	30
— Healthcare	35
2.1.3 -The Concept of Primary Healthcare	36
— Characteristics of Primary Healthcare	42
— Elements of Primary Healthcare	43
— Principles of Primary Healthcare	43
2.1.4 -Global Conference on Primary Healthcare	45
2.1.5 -The Concept of Citizens' Participation	46
— Types of Citizens' Participation in the Healthcare System	50
— Aims of Citizens' Participation	52
— Characteristics of Citizens' Participation	52
— Benefits of Citizen's Participation in Policy Implementation	53
— Challenges of Effective Citizens' Participation	54
2.1.6— Empirical Review of Citizens' Participation and Primary Healthcare	56
— Australia	56
— The Pacific	58
— Nepal	59
— Scotland	59
— Ireland	60
— South Africa	60
2.1.7 —Healthcare in Nigeria	62
— Methods of Healthcare Service delivery in Nigeria	63

— Healthcare Reforms	_ 65
— Current Health Status	_ 69
-2.1.8— Structure of the Nigerian Healthcare System	_ 72
— Tertiary	_ 72
— Secondary	_ 73
— Primary	_ 73
— Private Sector and Non-Governmental Organisations	75
-2.1.9— Primary Healthcare Policy in Nigeria	76
— Primary Healthcare Policy Implementation in Nigeria	81
-2.1.10— Role of Citizens' Participation in Primary Healthcare Policy	
— Implementation	83
-2.1.11— Ladder of Citizens' Participation	86
2.2— Theoretical Framework	_ 89
-2.5.1— Political Systems Theory	_ 90
— Criticism of Political Systems Theory	92
— Application of the Theory	93
2.3— Gap in Literature	_ 96
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY	_ 99
3.0 Preamble	99
3.1 Research Design	99
3.2 Population of the Study	99
3.3 Sampling Frame and Sampling Technique	_ 102
3.4 Sampling Size Determination	105

Commented [WU4]: Align your pages appropriately

3.5 Methods of Data Collection	107
Sources of Data Collection	108
Procedure for Data Collection	108
3.6 Instruments of Data Collection	110
3.7 Methods of Data Analysis	114
3.8 Validity of Instruments of Data Collection	115
3.9 Reliability of Instruments of Data Collection	116
3.10 Ethical Considerations	118
3.11 Brief Ogun State Profile	120
-Health Profile of Ogun State	121
CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS	123
4.0 Preamble	123
4.1 Response Rate	123
4.2 Demographic Characteristics of Respondents	125
4.2.1 Frequency and Percentage Distribution of Socio-Demographic	125
4.3 Descriptive Analysis and Interpretations	127
4.3.1 Restatement of Research Objective and Question One	127
4.3.2 Restatement of Research Objective and Question Two	132
4.3.3 Restatement of Research Objective and Question Three	137
4.3.4 Restatement of Research Objective and Question Four	139
4.4 Testing of Hypotheses	141
4.4.1 Hypothesis One	141
4.4.2 Hypothesis Two	142
4.4.3 Hypothesis Three	146
4.4.4 Hypothesis Four	148
4.5 Thematic Analysis on Qualitative Findings	149
4.5.1 Theme One: General Assessment of Primary Healthcare	150
4.5.2 Theme Two: Public Awareness and Citizen Enlightenment	151

4.5.3 Theme Three: Citizen Engagement and Service Quality	153
4.5.4 Theme Four: Communication and Customer Services	155
4.5.5 Theme Five: Government Financial Empowerment	156
CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION	159
5.0 Preamble	159
5.1 Discussion of Findings for Research Objective One	159
5.2 Discussion of Findings for Research Objective Two	161
5.3 Discussion of Findings for Research Objective Three	163
5.4 Discussion of Findings for Research Objective Four	165
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	168 7
6.0 Preamble	168 7
6.1 Summary	168 7
6.2 Conclusion	170 69
6.3 Contributions to Knowledge	172 1
6.4 Recommendations	175 4
6.4.1 Limitations of the Study	178 7
6.4.2 Suggestions for Further Studies	179 8
REFERENCES	180 79
APPENDIX A	201 1
APPENDIX B	205 5
APPENDIX C	
210 0	
APPENDIX D	
211 1	
APPENDIX E	
212 2	
APPENDIX F	
213 3	

APPENDIX G

2144

APPENDIX H

2155

APPENDIX I

2166

LIST OF TABLES

TABLES	PAGE	DESCRIPTION	DESCRIPTION
3.1		Census Population Distribution by LGAs in Ogun State	101
3.2		Population of the Study	102
3.3		Citizens Sample Size Determinant with ± 5 percent, Precision Levels	106
3.4		Population of the Study Sample Size	107
3.5		Profile of Qualitative Respondents	110
3.6		Data Collection and Analysis Matrix	115
3.7		Cronbach Alpha Testing of Items Reliability	117
3.8		Cronbach Alpha Individual Testing of Items Reliability	118
4.1		Summary of Questionnaire Distributed and Completed	123
4.2		Breakdown (in Aggregate) of Questionnaire Distribution and Retrieval	124
4.3		Frequency and Percentage of Demographic Characteristics of Respondents	125
4.4		Descriptive Statistics of Relationship	128
4.5		Descriptive Statistics of Mechanism	133
4.6		Descriptive Statistics of Challenges	138
4.7		Descriptive Statistics of Strategies	139

4.8	Correlation of Relationship	141
4.9	Variables Measured	141
4.10	Summary of Hypothesis One	142
4.11	ANOVA of Mechanism Relationship	143
4.12	Coefficient of Mechanism	144
4.13	ANOVA of Summary of Hypothesis Two	146
4.14	Correlation of Challenges	147
4.15	Summary of Hypothesis Three	147
4.16	Correlation of Strategies	148
4.17	Summary of Hypothesis Four	149

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURES	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
2.1	Public Policy Cycle	22
2.2	Policy Triangle Analysis	25
2.3	The Determinants of Health	32
2.4	Social Determinants of Health	34
2.5	Organisation Structure of Nigerian Medical Worker in Primary Healthcare	80
2.6	Arnstein's Ladder Representation of Citizens' Participation	89
2.7	Political Systems Theory	92

ABBREVIATIONS

CONTENT	DESCRIPTION
ACA	Affordable Care Act
AIDS	Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
<u>CBPHC</u>	<u>Community Based Public Healthcare</u>
<u>COPC</u>	<u>Community Oriented Primary Care</u>
<u>CPHC</u>	Comprehensive <u>(Primary)</u> Healthcare Centre
<u>CSDH</u>	<u>Commission on Social Determinants of Health</u>
<u>DOT</u>	<u>Direct Observation Treatment</u>
<u>EPI</u>	<u>Expanded Programme on Immunization</u>
FMOH	Federal Ministry of Health
<u>GDP</u>	<u>Gross Domestic Product</u>
HC	Health Centre
<u>HDRDR</u>	Human Development Report
<u>HFC</u>	<u>Health Facility Committee</u>
HIV	Human Immunodeficiency Virus
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Justified, Space After: 0 pt, Line spacing: 1.5 lines

Formatted: Font: 12 pt

Formatted: Space After: 0 pt, Line spacing: 1.5 lines

LGAs	Local Government Areas
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
NDHS	National Demographic and Health Survey
NGOs	Non-Government Organisations
NHI	National Health Insurance
NHS	National Health Services
NPHCDA	National Primary HealthCare Development Agency
NPOs	Non-profit Organizations
ORHP	Oral Rehydration Therapy
OSHDP	Ogun State Strategic Health Development Plan
OSMOH	Ogun State Ministry of Health
PCT	Patient Care Teams
PMNCH	Partnership for Maternal, Newborn & Child Health
PHCs	Primary Healthcare Centres
SPHC	Selective Primary Healthcare
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
TBA	Traditional Birth Attendants
UHC	Universal Health Coverage
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UNICEF	United Nations Children’s Fund
WHO	World Health Organization

LIST OF APPENDIXES

APPENDIX	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
A	Focus Group Discussion Guide and Interview Guide with selected citizens	201
B	Citizen Research Questionnaire	205
C	Letter of Introduction-Chairman, Local Government Service Commission (Yewa South)	210
D	Letter of Introduction-Chairman, Local Government Service Commission (Sagamu)	211
E	Letter of Introduction- State Primary Healthcare Coordinator	212
F	Abeokuta South Local Government- Executive Chairman	213
G	Letter of Introduction, Executive Chairman-Remo North Local Government Area	214
H	List of Public Health Facilities in Ewekoro Local Government Area	215

ABSTRACT

This study focused on investigating the relationship between citizens' participation and primary healthcare policy implementation in Ogun State, Nigeria from 2009-2019. Citizens' participation is a component of primary healthcare that has been minimally researched in developing countries such as Nigeria. However, it has been utilised in many external countries in creating accountability and enhancing healthcare policy implementation. This way, the healthcare system is universal and equitable, ensuring good health and wellbeing of all citizens for a robust national and sustainable development. To accomplish this, four specific objectives were formulated. The study was predicated upon the application of Political Systems Theory which explains the need and influence of diverse stakeholders in the public and health systems discourse. A cross-sectional research design was employed with qualitative and quantitative method of data collection: in-depth interviews, focus group discussions and Citizens' Participation Questionnaire to gather information from citizens at 12 Local Government Areas (LGAs) of Ogun State. Corroborating materials were obtained from primary healthcare coordinators/medical doctors and other health professionals. Through a multi-stage sampling technique (stratified, purposive and simple random), 500 respondents were sampled. Data collected were analysed with univariate statistical tools of frequency and percentage, bivariate analysis of inferential statistics with Karl Pearson Product Moment Correlation and Linear Regression; and [qualitative](#) data were coded and thematically analysed under five (5) themes. The significant level was considered when $p < 0.05$. The results revealed that there is a positive and significant relationship between citizens' participation and a successful primary healthcare policy implementation in Ogun State. This was corroborated by the high percentage of citizens as members within local and state associations, forms of citizens' participation mechanisms, which resonates to a sense of citizens empowerment. However, the impact of the relationship and participation are not seen in the citizens nor within their communities, thereby revealing a *tokenism* level of participation to appease the citizens. The study therefore underscores a departure from the norm with the need