### BUSINESS ENVIRONMENT AND FIRM PERFORMANCE IN NIGERIA

MAIJEH PAUL-DAVID CHUKWUEBUKA (13AF014945)
B.Sc. Economics, Covenant University, Ota Ogun State.

#### BUSINESS ENVIRONMENT AND FIRM PERFORMANCE IN NIGERIA

BY

# MAIJEH PAUL-DAVID CHUKWUEBUKA (13AF014945) B.Sc. Economics, Covenant University, Ota Ogun State.

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED TO THE SCHOOL OF POSTGRADUATE STUDIES IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENT FOR THE AWARD OF MASTER OF SCIENCE (M.Sc.) IN ECONOMICS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS AND DEVELOPMENT STUDIES, COLLEGE OF MANAGEMENT AND SOCIAL SCIENCES, COVENANT UNIVERSITY, OTA, OGUN STATE

SEPTEMBER, 2021

## **ACCEPTANCE**

(Dean, School of Post Graduate Studies)	Signature & Date
Prof. Akan B. Williams	••••••
	5- <b>g</b>
(Secretary, School of Post Graduate Studies)	Signature & Date
Mr. John A. Philip	
College of Management and Social Sciences, Covenant University	ersity, Ota, Ogun State, Nigeria.
award of the degree of Master of Science in Economics in	the Department of Economics,
This is to attest that this dissertation is accepted in partial fulfi	lment of the requirements for the

#### **DECLARATION**

I, MAIJEH, PAUL-DAVID CHUKWUEBUKA (13AF014945) declares that this research was carried out by me under supervision of Professor Isaiah Olurinola of the Department of Economics and Development Studies, College of Management and Social Sciences, Covenant University, Ota, Nigeria. I attest that the dissertation has not been presented either wholly or partially for the award of any degree elsewhere. All sources of data and scholarly information used in this dissertation are duly acknowledged.

MAIJEH, PAUL-DAVID CHUKWUEBUKA	••••••
	Signature & Date

#### **CERTIFICATION**

We certify that this dissertation titled "BUSINESS ENVIRONMENT AND FIRM PERFORMANCE IN NIGERIA" is an original research work carried out by MAIJEH, PAUL-DAVID CHUKWUEBUKA (13AF014945) in the Department of Economics and Development Studies, College of Management and Social Sciences, Covenant University, Ota, Ogun State, Nigeria, under the supervision of Professor Isaiah Olurinola. We have examined and found this work acceptable as part of the requirement for the award of Master of Science, Economics.

Prof. Isaiah Olurinola	•••••
(Supervisor)	Signature & Date
Prof. Evans Osabuohien	
(Head of Department)	Signature & Date
Prof. Adebayo B. Aromolaran	••••••
(External Examiner)	Signature & Date
Prof. Akan B. Williams	
(Dean School of Post Graduate Studies)	Signature & Date

## **DEDICATION**

This dissertation is dedicated to the Almighty God. It is also dedicated to my parents, who have always supported and prayed for me.

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I want to give God all the glory for strength, help and grace upon me in completing this programme.

With gratitude in my heart, I want to appreciate the Chancellor and Chairman of the Board of Regents, Covenant University, Dr. David O. Oyedepo for creating this academic and spiritual platform. I also want to sincerely appreciate the Vice Chancellor, Prof. Abiodun H. Adebayo, the Registrar, Dr. Oluwasegun Omiodiora and the entire management staff of Covenant University for following through with this vision.

I want to acknowledge the leadership of the Dean, School of Postgraduate Studies, Prof. Akan B. Williams, the Dean, College of Management and Social Sciences, Prof. U. Uwuigbe, the Sub Dean, School of Postgraduate Studies, Dr. Emmanuel Amoo.

My profound appreciation goes to my expert and amazing supervisor, Prof. Isaiah Olurinola for his thorough patience, guidance, and unmatched mentorship. I will always be extremely grateful to you for this opportunity sir.

To the Head, Department of Economics and Development Studies, Prof. Evans Osabuohien and all my lecturers in the Department; Prof. P. Alege, Dr. H. Okodua, Dr. E. Urhie, Dr. G. Obindah, Dr. O. Ewetan, Dr. M. Oladosun, Dr. E. Bowale, Dr. N. Adeleye, Dr O. Owolabi, Dr. A. Ogundipe, Dr. O. Ola-David, I say a very big thank you.

I will also like to appreciate Mr. Romanus Osabohien, a faculty in the Department of Economics, Covenant University, Amr Hosny a researcher in the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and Professor Niyonsaba Sebigunda of the University of Guma, Congo for their profound guidance and unperturbed access all through.

To my loving parents, Dr. Paul and Dr (Mrs) Funke Maijeh, I am extremely grateful for the emotional and financial support all through my education, it has and will always mean the world to me. I say God Bless and replenish you, and I pray you reap the fruits of your labour in the name of Jesus Christ.

To my friends, and colleagues: Michael, Oseghale, Demola, Emmy P, Mercy, F.K. and others not mentioned, thank you for your emotional support.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

COVER PAGE	i
ACCEPTANCE	ii
DECLARATION	iii
CERTIFICATION	iv
DEDICATION	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	vi
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vii
LIST OF TABLES	xi
LIST OF FIGURES	xiv
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XV
ABSTRACT	xvii
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background to the Study	1
1.2 Statement of the Research Problem	4
1.3 Research Questions	7
1.4 Objectives of the Study	7
1.5 Research Hypotheses	7
1.6 Scope of the Study	8
1.7 Significance of the Study	9
1.8 Outline of the Study	9
1.9 Operational Definition of Terms	10
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	11
2.1 Preamble	11
2.2 Conceptual Review	11
2.2.1 Concept of the Business Environment	11
2.2.2 Internal Business Environment	13
2.2.3 External Business Environment	14
2.2.4 Firm Performance	16
2.3 Review of Theoretical Issues	17
2.3.1 Mainstream Theory of the Firm	17
2.3.2 Theories of the Business Environment	18
2.4 Methodological and Empirical Review	21
2.4.1 Summary of Some Empirical Literature	32
2.5 Gaps in the Literature	37
2.6 Stylised Facts	37

2.6.1 Business Environment Cross-Country Comparisons	38
2.6.2 Nigeria's Institutional Performance (Measured by CPIA)	43
2.6.3 Firm Level Facts (World Bank Enterprise Survey)	44
2.6.4 Electricity Supply and Accessibility	44
2.6.5 Customs and Trade Regulation	45
2.6.6 Access to Finance and Credit	46
2.6.7 Corruption as an Obstacle	48
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY	49
3.1 Preamble	49
3.2 Research Design	49
3.3 Theoretical Framework	50
3.3.1 Contingency Theory of Organisations	50
3.3.2 Cobb-Douglas Production Function	51
3.4 Conceptual Framework	52
3.5 Model Specification	54
3.6 Techniques of Estimation	58
3.6.1 Ordinary Least Squares (OLS) Estimation Technique	58
3.6.2 Propensity Score Matching	58
3.7 Definition and Measurement of Variables	60
3.7.1 Dependent Variables	60
3.7.2 Independent and Control Variables	61
3.7.3 External Business Environment Constraints Index (EBECI)	62
3.8 Sources of Data	65
CHAPTER FOUR: PRESENTATION OF RESULTS	67
4.1 Preamble	67
4.2 Background Information on the Firms	67
4.3 Descriptive Statistics	71
4.4 Results from Econometric Analysis	76
4.4.1 Effect of Business Environment on Employment Growth: OLS Approach	76
4.4.2 Impact of Business Environment on Firm Performance: Propensity Score Mate	ching 79
4.4.3 Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Employment Growth – Total Industry	79
4.4.4 Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Employment Growth – Manufacturing and Services Firms.	81
4.4.5 Impact of Business Environment (Electricity Obstacles) on Employment Grov Domestic and Foreign Firms	vth – 82

	4.4.6 Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Employment Growth – Firms Operating in Northern and Southern Nigeria	83
	4.4.7 Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth – Total Industry	85
	4.4.8 Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth – Manufacturing and Service Firms	86
	4.4.9 Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth – Domestic and Foreign Firms	1 87
	4.4.10 Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth – Firms Operating in Northern and Southern Nigeria	89
	4.4.11 Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth – Total Industry	91
	4.4.12 Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth – Manufacturing an Service Firms	id 92
	4.4.13 Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth – Domestic and For Firms	reign 93
	4.4.14 Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth – Firms Operating i Northern and Southern Nigeria	n 94
	4.4.15 Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation – Manufacturing	96
	4.4.16 Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation – Domestic and Foreig Firms	gn 97
	4.4.17 Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation – Firms Operating in Northern and Southern Nigeria	98
	4.4.18 Impact of Finance Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation – Manufacturing	101
	4.4.19 Impact of Finance Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation – Domestic and Foreign Firms	101
	4.4.20 Impact of Finance Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation – Firms Operating in Northern and Southern Nigeria	103
	4.4.21 Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation – Manufacturing	105
	4.4.22 Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation – Domestic and Fore Firms	eign 105
	4.4.23 Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation – Firms Operating in Northern and Southern Nigeria	107
	4.5 Test of Hypotheses	109
	4.6 Discussion of Results	111
C	CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	114
	5.1 Preamble	114
	5.2 Summary	114
	5.3 Conclusion	115
	5.4 Contribution to Knowledge	117
	5.5 Recommendations	118
	5.6 Suggestion for Further Studies	120

REFERENCES	121
APPENDICES	133
Sample Survey Questions	133

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Theoretical Construct on Business Environment and Firm Performance	20
Table 2.2: Summary of Some Empirical Literature	32
Table 2.3: Emerging Economies EDB Comparisons	41
Table 2.4: Heatmap - Ease of Doing Business Ranking	42
Table 3.1: Description of Variables	65
Table 4.1: Industry Classification	67
Table 4.2: Sub Sectors Surveyed	68
Table 4.3: States	69
Table 4.4: Geopolitical Zones	70
Table 4.5: Zones Simplified	70
Table 4.6: Social Economic Characteristics of Firms	72
Table 4.7: Top Six Business Environment Factors Serving as Obstacles	75
Table 4.8: Effect of Business Environment on Employment Growth	76
Table 4.9: Multicollinearity Test (Variance Inflation Factor)	78
Table 4.10: LINK Test	78
Table 4.11: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Employment Growth in the Total Industry	80
Table 4.12.a: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Employment Growth in Manufacturing Sector Firms	81
Table 4.12.b: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Firm Performance on Employment Grown in Service Sector Firms	th 81
Table 4.13.a: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Employment Growth in Domestic Firms	82
Table 4.13.b: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Employment Growth in Foreign Firms	82
Table 4.14.a: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Employment Growth in Firms Operating Northern Nigeria	in 84
Table 4.14.b: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Employment Growth in Firms Operating Southern Nigeria	in 84

Table 4.15: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth in the Total Industry	86
Table 4.16.a: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth in Manufacturing Sect Firms	tor 86
Table 4.16.b: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth in Service Sector Firm	ıs 86
Table 4.17.a: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth in Domestic Firms	88
Table 4.17.b: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth in Foreign Firms	88
Table 4.18.a: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth in Firms Operating in Northern Nigeria	89
Table 4.18.b: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Employment Growth in Firms Operating in Southern Nigeria	89
Table 4.19: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth in the Total Industry	91
Table 4.20.a: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth in Manufacturing Sector Firms	92
Table 4.20.b: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth in Service Sector Firms	92
Table 4.21.a: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth in Domestic Firms	93
Table 4.21.b: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth in Foreign Firms	93
Table 4.22.a: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth - Firms Operating i Northern Nigeria	n 94
Table 4.22.b: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Employment Growth - Firms Operating i Southern Nigeria	in 94
Table 4.23: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Manufacturing Sector Firms	r 97
Table 4.24.a: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Domestic Firms	98
Table 4.24.b: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Foreign Firms	98
Table 4.25.a: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Firms Operating in Northern Nigeria	99
Table 4.25.b: Impact of Electricity Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Firms Operating in Southern Nigeria	99
Table 4.26: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Total Industry xii	101

Table 4.27.a: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Domestic Firms	102
Table 4.27.b: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Foreign Firms	102
Table 4.28.a: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Firms Operating in Northern Nigeria	103
Table 4.28.b: Impact of Finance Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Firms Operating in Southern Nigeria	103
Table 4.29: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Manufacturing Sect Firms	tor 105
Table 4.30.a: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Domestic Firms	106
Table 4.30.b: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Foreign Firms	106
Table 4.31.a: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Firms Operating i Northern Nigeria	n 108
Table 4.31.b: Impact of Corruption Obstacles on Capacity Utilisation - Firms Operating i Southern Nigeria	in 108

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Ease of Doing Business Scores amongst West African countries.	39
Figure 2.2: Ease of Doing Business Scores amongst Sub-Saharan African countries.	40
Figure 2.3: Gross Domestic Product (GDP) amongst the highest 20 EDB scored Sub-Sah African countries.	naran 40
Figure 2.4: CPIA Indicators for Nigeria.	43
Figure 2.5: Firm's view on electricity supply and accessibility as an obstacle.	44
Figure 2.6: Firm's view on customs and trade regulation as an obstacle.	45
Figure 2.7: Firm's view on customs and trade regulation as an obstacle located within exzones.	port 45
Figure 2.8: Firm's view on customs and trade regulation as an obstacle, located within industrial parks.	46
Figure 2.9: Firm's view on access to finance as an obstacle.	47
Figure 2.10: Percentage share of access to finance as an obstacle	47
Figure 3.1: Theoretical Framework.	51
Figure 3.2: Conceptual Framework.	53
Figure 4.1: Largest Business Environment Obstacles	74
Figure 4.2: Propensity Score Distribution for Electricity Obstacle.	84
Figure 4.3: Propensity Score Distribution for Finance Obstacles.	90
Figure 4.4: Propensity Score Distribution for Corruption Obstacles.	96
Figure 4.5: Propensity Score Distribution for Electricity Obstacles.	100
Figure 4.6: Propensity Score Distribution for Finance Obstacles.	104
Figure 4.7: Propensity Score Distribution for Corruption Obstacles.	108

#### LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ATE: Average Treatment Effect

**ATT:** Average Treatment Effect on the Treated

ATU: Average Treatment Effect on the Untreated

**CAPU:** Capacity Utilisation

**CPIA:** Country Policy Institutional Assessment

**EBECI:** External Business Environment Constraint Index

**EDB:** Ease of Doing Business

**EG:** Employment Growth

**FDI:** Foreign Direct Investment

FMCG: Fast-Moving Consumer Goods

**FPI:** Foreign Portfolio Investment

**GDP:** Gross Domestic Product

ICRC: Infrastructure Concession Regulatory Commission

LDC: Least Developing Countries

MENA: Middle East and North Africa

NCR: National Collateral Registry

**NERC:** Nigerian Electricity Regulatory Commission

**NGF:** Nigerian Governor's Forum

NNM: Nearest Neighbour Matching

**OLS:** Ordinary Least Squares

**PCA:** Principal Component Analysis

**PEBEC:** Presidential Enabling Business Environment Council

**PSM:** Propensity Score Matching

**SDG:** Sustainable Development Goals

**SME:** Small and Medium Enterprises

SSA: Sub Saharan Africa

**TSA:** Treasury Single Account

VIF: Variance Inflation Factor

**WBES:** World Bank Enterprise Survey

#### **ABSTRACT**

The business environment remains an important determinant of economic growth and prosperity in any economy as a result of its impact on the real sector. Hence, understanding its influence and impact, as well as studying the usefulness of policy remains sacrosanct. The study therefore examines the impact of business environments on firm performance in Nigeria across various levels of firm characteristics. The study utilises the 2014 World Bank Enterprise Survey (WBES) for Nigeria to measure the business environment, firm characteristics as well as firm performance. To measure the business environment, the study utilises an indexation methodology for the top six business environment obstacles experienced by firms, and employment growth and capacity utilisation to measure the performance of firms. Consequently, utilising the OLS estimation technique the study finds business environment obstacles to have a negative effect on firm performance, across varying levels of firm characteristics. Subsequent diagnostics tests such as the LINK test and VIF show that the model does not suffer from selection bias and multicollinearity. Furthermore, employing the PSM technique to evaluate the impact of the business environment on firm performance, the study finds that firms who experienced electricity, access to finance and corruption as a moderate to very severe obstacle performed significantly worse than firms who experienced otherwise, across varying levels of firm characteristics such as the firm sector, ownership and location. The findings provide the Nigerian government as well as relevant agencies policy implications to improve business environments and reduce obstacles to the barest minimum. In sum, improving electricity supply and delivery, increasing channels for access to credit and finance, as well as curbing corruption and bribery to the barest minimum will improve the performance of the firms, hence the real sector, and consequently improve economic growth and prosperity.

**Key Words:** Business Environment, Business Obstacles, Firm Performance, Employment Growth, Capacity Utilisation and Propensity Score Matching.