INFLUENCE OF URBAN UPGRADES ON INDIGENOUS BUILDING MORPHOLOGY IN THE CITY CORE OF ABEOKUTA, NIGERIA

ADENAIKE, FOLAHAN ANTHONY (16PCA01315)

JANUARY, 2023

INFLUENCE OF URBAN UPGRADES ON INDIGENOUS BUILDING MORPHOLOGY IN THE CITY CORE ABEOKUTA, NIGERIA

BY

ADENAIKE, FOLAHAN ANTHONY (16PCA01315) B. Sc Architecture, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife M. Sc Architecture, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE SCHOOL OF POSTGRADUATE STUDIES IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE AWARD OF THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY (Ph.D) IN ARCHITECTURE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF ARCHITECTURE, COLLEGE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, COVENANT UNIVERSITY, OTA, OGUN STATE, NIGERIA

JANUARY, 2023

ACCEPTANCE

This is to attest that this report is accepted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) in Architecture in the Department of Architecture, College of Science and Technology, Covenant University, Ota, Nigeria.

Miss Adefunke F. Oyinloye (Secretary, School of Postgraduate Studies)

Signature and Date

Prof. Akan B. Williams (Dean, School of Postgraduate Studies)

Signature and Date

DECLARATION

I, ADENAIKE, FOLAHAN ANTHONY, declare that this thesis was carried out entirely by me under the supervision of Prof. Joseph A. Fadamiro of the Department of Architecture, School of Environmental Technology, Federal University of Technology Akure, Ondo State and Prof. Akunnaya P. Opoko of the Department of Architecture, College of Environmental Sciences, Bells University of Technology, Ota, Ogun State, Nigeria. This thesis has never been presented wholly or partly, for any degree or qualification of this university or any other institution of learning. All scholarly information in this thesis were duly acknowledged.

ADENAIKE, FOLAHAN ANTHONY

Signature and Date

Prof. Akan B. Williams (Dean, School of Postgraduate Studies)

v

This thesis, titled "INFLUENCE OF URBAN UPGRADES ON INDIGENOUS BUILDING MORPHOLOGY IN ABEOKUTA CITY CORE, NIGERIA", carried out by ADENAIKE, FOLAHAN ANTHONY under our supervision, meets the requirements of a Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) thesis in the Department of Architecture, College of Science and Technology, Covenant University, Ota, Ogun State, Nigeria. We certify that this thesis has not been submitted for a Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) thesis or any other degree in Covenant University or any other university. It is hereby approved for literary presentation.

CERTIFICATION

Prof. Joseph A. Fadamiro (Main Supervisor)

Prof. Akunnaya P. Opoko (Co-supervisor)

Prof. Adedapo A. Oluwatayo (Head of Department)

Prof. Emmanuel B. Jaiyeoba (External Examiner)

Signature and Date

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to the glory of God and the rich heritage of the Yoruba culture.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I foremost acknowledge my God for seeing me through the programme. I learnt deeper lessons in humility, "emptying my cup" and architecture by His grace. I thank the Chancellor, Dr. David O. Oyedepo for bearing the vision of this great university. I also thank the Vice-Chancellor, Prof. Adebayo H. Abiodun and the Registrar Mrs. Regina A. Tobi-David for sustaining integrity, hard work and high standards in the institution. I appreciate the Dean, Prof. Akan B. Williams and the Sub Dean of the School of Postgraduate Studies Dr Emmanuel O. Amoo, for diligently seeing to good quality theses from the University. I am grateful to the Dean of the College of Science and Technology, Prof. Timothy A. Anake .

I appreciate the efforts of the staff of the Department of Architecture both past and present in the likes of Prof. Eziyi I. Ibem, Prof. Adeboye, Prof Adedapo O. Oluwatayo, Dr. Aderonmu, Dr. Izobo-Martins, Dr. Anthony Sholanke and all the others who made themselves available at all times to enrich the work. I appreciate the contributions of my supervisors, Prof. Akinlabi J. Fadamiro and Prof. Akunnaya Opoko especially their patience as the work progressed. I say a big thank you to my classmates, Dr. Sen Irua, Dr. Tosin Babalola, Arc. Funmi Adetoro, Arc. Niyi Olagunju and Arc. Seyi Awosika.

On the field, I thank, Mr. Jefferson Okojie, Dr. Murikisu Onigemo, Tpl. Akoni, Tpl. Taiwo, for their contributions and guidance while traversing the length and breadth of Abeokuta for data.

I acknowledge the support of staff of Isthmus Marginal Services in the persons of Arc. Tope Ayobandele, Miss Funmi Adewunmi, Miss Chinekwu Udemezue, Arc. Tunde Yunus and Mrs Aderonke Adedeji who helped with office and secretarial assistance on the text.

I thank the members of staff of Department of Architecture, Lagos State University of Science and Technology for their support.

I appreciate my loving wife Mrs. Olabimpe O. Adenaike and children Oluwatobi, Eniabiire and Tolorunleke for their emotional and spiritual support at all times

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ii iii
iv
v
vi
vii
xix
1
1
1
3
4
5
8
9
11
11
11
12
12
12
13
13
13
13
13

CHAPTER TWO	14
LITERATURE REVIEW	14
2.1 Preamble	14
2.2 Urban architecture	14
2.3 Building morphology	18
2.3.1 Forms and elements in architecture	20
2.3.2 Architecture of Yoruba of Southwest Nigeria	24

2.3.3 Evolution of indigenous architectural building morphology in Abeokuta city core	27
2.4 Urban upgrades	33
2.4.1 Upgrades in historic city Centres	38
2.4.2 Effects of urban upgrades on built forms	41
2.4.3 Urban upgrades in Southwest Nigeria	46
2.5. Gaps in the literature	49
2.6 Theoretical review	50
2.7 Conceptual framework	54
CHAPTER THREE	59
METHODOLOGY	59
3.1. Preamble	59
3.2. Research philosophy	59
3.3. Research design	60
3.3.1 Study population	61
3.3.2 Sampling	61
3.3.3 Sample size computation	64
3.3.4 Sampling techniques	65
3.4. Data requirements and sources	66
3.5. Data collection and instruments	68
3.5.1 Field observation and counting	68
3.5.2 Interviews with government officials	68
3.5.3 Interviews with residents	69
3.5.4 Questionnaire survey	69
3.6. Operationalization of quantitative variables	70
3.7. Summary of data collection methods and analyses	70
3.8. Data reliability and integrity	72
CHAPTER FOUR	73
RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS	73
4.1. Preamble	73
4.2 Indigenous building morphology of Abeokuta till 2009	76
4.3. Urban upgrades in Abeokuta city core	80
4.3.1 Upgrades executed from 2009 to 2011	85
4.3.2 Upgrades executed from 2011 to 2018	86
4.4. New building typologies in Abeokuta city core	88
4.5 Forms and elements of the new buildings	90

4.6. Residents' reasons for adopting new forms and elements in the upgraded	101
4.7. Guidelines for future upgrades programmes	102
4.7.1 Excerpts from literature review	102
4.7.2 Views of technocrats	104
4.7.3 Respondents' Attitudes towards urban upgrades, social cohesion and building morphology	108
4.8 Spatiotemporal findings of the Abeokuta core area during the study period	109
4.9 Evidence of alteration in buildings	110
4.10 Discussions	110
4.10.1 Morphology and current threshold of indigenous building pattern in study area	110
4.10.2 Content and nature of urban upgrades in Abeokuta city core during the study period 115	d
4.10.3 New building typologies in the study area	117
4.10.4 Forms and elements of new building typologies	120
4.10.5 Reasons for adopting new forms and elements	142
4.10.6 Guides for future urban upgrades to promote heritage preservation	144

CHAPTER FIVE	146
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	146
5.1 Summary of the study	146
5.2 Research findings	146
5.3 Implications of the study	149
5.4 Limitations of the study	149
5.5 Contribution to knowledge	150
5.6 Recommendations	151
5.7 Areas for further study	152
5.8 Conclusion	152

REFERENCES

153

LIST OF TABLES

TABLES	PAGES
Table 3.1: Summary of sampling methods for research	74
Table 3.2: Data collection analyses	78
Table 3.3: Observation checklist for evidence of alterations in buildings and conditions	
of forms and elements	79
Table 4.1: Socio-demographic data on respondents	81
Table 4.2: Data from observation of buildings in the sedentary section of the study area	82
Table 4.3: Data from observation of buildings in the upgraded section of the study area	83
Table 4.4: Building typologies by land use in sedentary and upgraded areas	88
Table 4.5: Frequencies of different architectural building styles and the percentages of	
their occurrences in the sedentary areas of the city core	89
Table 4.6: Frequencies of different architectural building styles and the percentages of	
their occurrences in the upgraded areas of the city core	89
Table 4.7: Percentage changes in building forms and elements in the study area	90
Table 4.8: Summary of responses on reasons for adoption of changes	100
Table 4.9: Content review of citations from literature review to guide future upgrades	101
Table 4.10: Content analysis of interview with Ogun State Slum Regeneration technocrat	103
Table 4.11: Attitudes towards urban upgrades and building morphology107	
Table 4.12: Urban upgrades and socio-cultural cohesion	108
Table 4.13: Change in building densities of neighbourhoods in the study area108	
Table 4.14 Evidence of alterations in the buildings the sedentary and upgraded areas	
showing building counts and percentages	109
Table 4.15: Changes in percentage occurrence of different architectural	
building styles in the sedentary and upgraded areas of the city core	111
Table 4.16: Summation of percentage occurrences of different architectural	
building styles in the sedentary and upgraded areas of the city core	112
Table 4.17: Upgrade programmes in Abeokuta core and the affected neighbourhoods	114
Table 4.18: Percentage change in building typologies in upgraded and sedentary areas	116
Table 4.19: Descriptive statistics for percentage changes in variable occurrences	120
Table 4.20: Descriptive statistics on change perceptions in building forms and elements	121
Table 4.21: Summary of non-parametric test of urban upgrades and building elements	122
Table 4.22: Summary of non-parametric test of urban upgrades and building forms	123
Table 4.23: Correlation between urban upgrades and forms building elements	124
Table 4.24: Chi-square computation for building forms and elements	124
Table 4.25: Wilcoxon Signed Ranks Test results for the relationship between urban	

TABLES	PAGES
upgrades and building forms and elements	125
Table 4.26: Building shapes in the sedentary and upgraded areas	129
Table 4.27: Symmetry in front elevations of buildings in the sedentary areas	130
Table 4.28: Front door sizes (width) in sedentary and upgraded areas	131
Table 4.29: Window sizes (width) in the sedentary and upgraded areas	132
Table 4.30: Presence of ornamentation in openings of buildings in the study area	133
Table 4.31: Presence of additive and subtractive forms in the sedentary and upgraded areas	s 133
Table 4.32: Basic roof forms in the sedentary sections of the study area	134
Table 4.33: Wall finishing materials in the sedentary and upgraded sections of the study are	ea 135
Table 4.34: Front door finishing materials in sedentary sections of the study area	136
Table 4.35: Window finishing materials in the sedentary and upgraded areas	137
Table 4.36: Eaves finishing materials in the sedentary sections of the study area	138
Table 4.37: Roof finishing materials in the sedentary sections of the study area	139
Table 4.38: Entrance area delineation in sedentary sections of the study area	140
Table 4.39: Summary of forms and elements of the emerging building patterns	141
Table 4.40: Summary of reasons for adopting new forms and elements	142
Table 4.41: Effects of urban upgrades and future proposals for the area	144

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURES	PAGES
Figure 1.1: Relationship between Building Morphology and Human Behaviour	3
Figure 1.2: Political map of Nigeria showing Ogun State	10
Figure 1.3. Abeokuta in Ogun State map	11
Figure 1.4: Map showing the limits of Abeokuta town	11
Figure 2.1: The arms of urban upgrades	42
Figure 2.2: Historic theory of urban form	59
Figure 2.3: Causal theories of urban upgrades and ultimately building morphology	61
Figure 2.4: The dynamic relationship between preservation and urban upgrades	
in the city core	62
Figure 2.5: How urban upgrades and human behaviour alter the city core architecture	63
Figure 2.6: A conceptual framework flow chart for the research	65

LIST OF PLATES

PLATES	PAGES
Plate 2.1: Kramgrasse, Berne, Switzerlands	16
Plate 2.2: Grabrodretorv, Conpenhagen, Denmark	16
Plate 2.3: A contemporary housing estate in Abeokuta, Nigeria	18
Plate 2.4: Vernacular architecture with Brazilian style influence	26
Plate 2.5 Susan Wenger's Building, Oshogbo	27
Plate 2.6: A picture of Olumo Rock taken in 1929	28
Plate 2.7: A two-room bush house captured in 1974	29
Plate 2.8: Picture of Olumo Rock	29
Plate 2.9: A central Madrid neighbourhood, Spain	40
Plate 2.10: Historic city centre Parte Vieja, San Sebastian, Spain	43
Plate 2.11: View of Nanluoguxiang Street, central Beijing	44
Plate 2.12: St. Peter's Basilica in Rome	44
Plate 2.13: Front view of the White House	45
Plate 2.14: Rear view of the White House in Washington D.C	45
Plate 3.1: Outline of neighbourhoods in the study area	61
Plate 3.2: Map of study area showing the major roads with upgrades	62
Plate 3.3: Satellite image of the neighbourhoods in the study area	62
Plate 4.1: A bush house unit within a compound	75
Plate 4.2: Progression in the bush house tradition	76
Plate 4.3: An adaptation of the 2-room bush house	76
Plate 4.4: Elevation of an old family compound at Ilagun, Abeokuta	77
Plate 4.5: Traditionl building style in Itoku, Abeokuta	77
Plate 4.6: Vernacular progression of the bush house	78
Plate 4.7: A relic of the Afro-Brazilian style in the Sodeke area of Abeokuta	78
Plate 4.8: Sapon, Abeokuta in 2014	79
Plate 4.9 Sapon, Abeokuta in 2019	80
Plate 4.10: Building abutting the reconstructed road in Oke-Itoku.	
The building limited the extent of road reconstruction	80
Plate 4.11: Saje neighbourhood of Abeokuta. The congested setting	
makes creating a thoroughfare without much demolition difficult	81
Plate 4.12: Ikija Road expansion in progress in 2019. Many buildings abutting	
the old road have been removed, leaving buildings oriented to interior	
roads and courts	81
Plate 4.13: Kuto, Abeokuta in 2008	82

PLATES	PAGES
Plate 4.14: Kuto Abeokuta in 2019	82
Plate 4.15: Commercialised frontages along Sokenu Road	91
Plate 4.16: Additive forms to indigenous buildings in upgraded areas	91
Plate 4.17: Subtractive forms of indigenous style in the upgraded	
neighbourhood in the study area	93
Plate 4.18: Evidence of change of building use with additive forms among	
vernacular buildings in the study area	93
Plate 4.19: Standardized windows and components in vernacular buildings	
in Abeokuta core	94
Plate 4.20: Corrugated iron sheets being used to replace old roofing sheets	
in recently upgraded city core area of Abeokuta	94
Plate 4.21: Use of contemporary roofing finishes with deep eaves in	
upgraded area of Abeokuta city core	95
Plate 4.22: Use of modern materials and vernacularized forms for a roof in	
upgraded areas of Abeokuta city core	95
Plate 4.23: Use of aluminium sheeting in a recent renovation after using	
corrugated iron sheets in previous renovations	96
Plate 4.24 600mm deep eaves of the late vernacular building era in a sedentary	
area of Abeokuta city core	96
Plate 4.25: 1000mm deep eaves of a building in the upgraded section	
of the city core	97
Plate 4.26: A renovated indigenous building with efforts to define the previously	
uncelebrated entrance in an upgraded part of Abeokuta city core	97
Plate 4.27: A new building at Sapon-Ijemo with features of both indigenous	
and modern building patterns. The entrance is not defined	98
Plate 4.28: Indigenous building style with steel window frames and glass panels	
in Ake, Abeokuta	98
Plate 4.29: Indigenous building style with Aluminium louvre carriers and	
glass blades in Ijemo, Abeokuta	99
Plate 4.30: Aluminium curtain walls and windows of recent buildings along	
Shokenu Road in Abeokuta	99
Plate 4.31: Variant of international style building in Itoku area of Abeokuta	113
Plate 4.32: A typical late vernacular style building with additive forms of contemporary	
materials on the ground floor to take advantage of the upgraded road	113
Plate 4.33: Shokenu Road, Erunbe, Abeokuta	115
Plate 4.34: A shopping complex at Sapon	115
XV	

LIST OF EQUATIONS

EQUATIONS	PAGES
Equation 1: Simple sample size calculation formula for finite populations	63
Equation 2: Slovin's formula for calculation of sample size for a finite population	64
Equation 3: The Spearman Rank Correlation Coefficient	123

APPENDICES

APPENDICES	PAGES
Appendix I: Questionnaire for field survey	168
Appendix II: Focus group and target individuals discussion	176
Appendix III: Plate 3a-b Front and side elevation of Chief Akindiléni home	212
Appendix IV: Chi-square and wilcoxon signed ranks tests results	182
Appendix V: Transcript of interview with Town Planning official	188
Appendix VI: Operationalisation of quantitative variables	191
Appendix VII: Summary of responses to factors responsible for adoption of curre	nt
building forms and elements	209
Appendix VIII: Tables of responses to factors responsible for adoption of current	
building forms and elements	210
Appendix IX: Satelite views of the study area	213

ABSTRACT

Indigenous architecture of the Yorubas documented over time have mainly been limited to the traditional and vernacular expositions with the morphology traced from the earliest structures and not explicit beyond the Afro-Brazilian style. The morphology of the indigenous buildings has progressed organically, based on the socio-cultural changes in the society. This progression is however prone to more rapid changes that tend to direct it towards building patterns from other cultures. Urban upgrades are common in city cores of Nigeria where the legacy of indigenous building patterns is most preserved within the urban setting. Abeokuta in southwest Nigeria has been highly reported in recent times as having witnessed urban upgrades that have led to very rapid changes in its socio-spatial environment. This study set out to investigate the impact of the urban upgrades carried out in the city core of Abeokuta between 2009 and 2018 on the forms and elements of the indigenous building morphology. This was done by tracing the morphology of the indigenous building pattern from the advent of settlements in the area till the study period as the first objective. Areas where urban upgrades have been carried out were identified and new building typologies that are evolving in the areas were analysed for changes in their forms and elements as different from the threshold of indigenous building morphology in the sedentary areas where upgrades were absent. The factors responsible for the adoption of the new forms and elements were subsequently identified. The research proceeded by examining literature, physically identifying and mapping out the upgraded sections of the city core, carrying out spot assessment of buildings with observation schedules, conducting interviews with state government officials and individuals in the study area and administering a close-ended questionnaire to generate requisite data and information on the objectives of the research. The data obtained from the research which were both quantitative and qualitative were subjected to analyses. It was discovered that the current threshold of the indigenous building morphology in the areas devoid of upgrading is still the post-vernacular style with strong inclinations towards the forms and elements of the early vernacular building pattern. The new buildings in the upgraded sections of the study area are mainly commercial and mixed-use buildings with a blend of postmodern forms and elements within the basic vernacular style. The new forms and elements in the aftermath of the regenerative efforts in the area are wider windows, long span aluminium roof finishes, deeper eaves and generally larger buildings. The research concluded that urban upgrades have stimulated far reaching changes in the indigenous building pattern around the areas where they have been carried out. These changes which were not pre-empted by the government while executing urban upgrades are reducing the patrimonial stock of the indigenous buildings and resulting to a loss of heritage values in the built environment. The study exposed the need for urban upgrade programmes to envisage and accommodate farther reaching changes in the indigenous building morphology when executed in historic city centres.

Keywords: building typologies; heritage preservation; historic city centres; indigenousarchitecture; urban upgrades.