

**STABILITY ANALYSIS OF DELAY DIFFERENTIAL EQUATION  
MODELS IN MATHEMATICAL BIOLOGY**

**EZEKIEL, IMEKELA DONALDSON  
(14PCD00857)**

**MAY, 2024**

**STABILITY ANALYSIS OF DELAY DIFFERENTIAL EQUATION  
MODELS IN MATHEMATICAL BIOLOGY**

**BY**

**EZEKIEL, IMEKELA DONALDSON  
(14PCD00857)**

**B.Sc. Mathematics, University of Benin, Benin-City, Nigeria  
M.Sc. Epidemiology and Biostatistics, University of Ibadan, Nigeria  
M.Sc. Mathematics, University of Ibadan, Nigeria  
M.Sc. Industrial Mathematics, Covenant University, Ota, Nigeria**

**A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE SCHOOL OF POSTGRADUATE  
STUDIES IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS  
FOR THE AWARD OF THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY  
(Ph. D) IN INDUSTRIAL MATHEMATICS IN THE DEPARTMENT OF  
MATHEMATICS, COLLEGE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY,  
COVENANT UNIVERSITY, OTA, OGUN STATE, NIGERIA**

**MAY, 2024**

## **ACCEPTANCE**

This is to attest that this thesis is accepted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) in Industrial Mathematics in the Department of Mathematics, College of Science and Technology, Covenant University, Ota, Ogun State, Nigeria.

**Miss Adefunke F. Oyinloye**  
**(Secretary, School of Post Graduate Studies)**

**Signature and Date**

**Prof. Akan B. Williams**  
**(Dean, School of Post Graduate Studies)**

**Signature and Date**

## **DECLARATION**

I, **EZEKIEL IMEKELA DONALDSON (14PCD00857)**, declare that this research work was carried out by me under the supervision of Prof. Samuel A. Iyase and Prof. Timothy A. Anake of the Department of Mathematics, College of Science and Technology, Covenant University, Ota, Ogun State, Nigeria. I attest that this thesis has not been presented either wholly or partially for the award of any degree elsewhere. All the sources of materials and scholarly publications used in the thesis are duly acknowledged accordingly.

**EZEKIEL IMEKELA DONALDSON**

**Signature and Date**

## **CERTIFICATION**

We certify that this thesis titled “**STABILITY ANALYSIS OF DELAY DIFFERENTIAL EQUATION MODELS IN MATHEMATICAL BIOLOGY**” is an original work carried out by **EZEKIEL, Imekela Donaldson** (14PCD00857) in the Department of Mathematics, College of Science and Technology, Covenant University, Ota, Ogun State, Nigeria, under the supervision of Prof. Samuel A. Iyase and Prof. Timothy A. Anake. We have examined and found the work acceptable as part of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph. D) degree in Industrial Mathematics.

**Prof. Samuel A. Iyase**  
**(Main Supervisor)**

**Signature and Date**

**Prof. Timothy A. Anake**  
**(Co-Supervisor)**

**Signature and Date**

**Dr. Olasunmbo O. Agboola**  
**(Head, Department of Mathematics)**

**Signature and Date**

**Prof. Mathew O. Omeike**  
**(External Examiner)**

**Signature and Date**

**Prof. Akan B. Williams**  
**(Dean, School of Postgraduate Studies)**

**Signature and Date**

## **DEDICATION**

To the glory of God and my dear children:

Oshukunuofayo Francis, Shemaze Enoch and Ashimije Clement

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First and foremost, I thank the Omnipotent, Omnipresent and Omniscience God who upholds all things by the word of his power for seeing me through the hurdles which one is bound to cross in an attempt to be intellectually relevant and balanced in life.

I sincerely appreciate the Chancellor and Chair, Board of Regents of Covenant University, Dr. David O. Oyedepo for the opportunity and enabling environment given me throughout this programme. I also thank the Vice-Chancellor, Covenant University, Prof. Abiodun H. Adebayo; Deputy Vice-Chancellor, Prof. Olujide A. Adekeye; and the Acting Registrar, Mrs. Regina A. Tobi-David. I am also indebted to Dean, School of Postgraduate Studies, Prof. Akan B. Williams; past and present Sub-Deans, School of Postgraduate Studies; Dean, College of Science and Technology, Prof. Timothy A. Anake; immediate past and present CST College Postgraduate Coordinators, and the entire management team of Covenant University for the enabling environment I enjoyed during my study.

I greatly thank and appreciate my Supervisors, Prof. Samuel A. Iyase and Prof. Timothy A. Anake for their motivation, patience, encouragements and assistance throughout the work. I am indebted to them for their guidance, advice and support and for painstakingly taking time of their tight administrative schedules to read and correct this thesis at various stages.

I must also thank the faculty and staff of the Department of Mathematics, Covenant University for their tolerance and patience throughout the programme. I equally appreciate the contributions of past and present Departmental Postgraduate Representatives for their numerous efforts towards the completion of this programme. I also thank the authority and management of The Federal Polytechnic, Ilaro for the opportunity and the enabling environment given me throughout this programme. I thank my good colleagues in the Department of Mathematics and Statistics for being there for me throughout the academic exile.

A special thanks and appreciation go to my dear wife, Mrs. Evelyn Ilamosi Ezekiel and my lovely children: Francis, Enoch and Clement for the many sacrifices they made in the course

of this programme. Their love, prayer, understanding, patience, and encouragement will remain evergreen in my memory.

I also thank my mother (of blessed memory), who though never understood it all but kept me in her prayers and supported me wholeheartedly. I greatly thank my siblings, Ezekiel Sylvester Sunday (Uncle Sunny), Ezekiel Orire (Oris) among others and my amiable sons, Ezekiel Mathias Olomije and Ezekiel Ozakafe Lawrence, who contributed immensely to the completion of this programme.

I equally appreciate the numerous lecturers, advisers and hosts of good persons and friends, too many to mention, who contributed immensely throughout the programme.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>CONTENTS</b>	<b>PAGES</b>
<b>COVER PAGE</b>	i
<b>TITLE PAGE</b>	ii
<b>ACCEPTANCE</b>	iii
<b>DECLARATION</b>	iv
<b>CERTIFICATION</b>	v
<b>DEDICATION</b>	vi
<b>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</b>	vii
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b>	ix
<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	xiii
<b>LIST OF SYMBOLS</b>	xiv
<b>ABBREVIATIONS</b>	xvi
<b>ABSTRACT</b>	xvii
<b>CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION</b>	1
1.1 Background to the Study	1
1.2 Statement of the Research Problem	5
1.3 Aim and Objectives of the Study	9
1.4 Justification for the Study	10
1.5 Scope of the Study	10
1.6 Definition of Terms	10
<b>CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	22
2.1 Introduction	22
2.2 Early Dynamical Models	22
2.3 Bifurcation Theory of Delay Differential Equations	24
2.4 Single Species Population in Biological Delay Systems	25
2.5 The Infectious Disease Model	31
2.6 Identified Gaps in Literature	34

<b>CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>36</b>
3.1 Introduction	36
3.2 Solutions of Linear and Non Linear Systems	37
3.3 Linear Delay Systems with Constant Coefficients	42
3.4 Method of Characteristics for Linear Stability Analysis	44
3.5 Hopf Bifurcation Theorem in $\mathbb{R}^2$	46
3.5.1 Conditions for Bifurcation	47
3.6 Stability Analysis of Positive Real Roots via Sturm Sequences	51
3.7 Method of Lyapunov and Lyapunov-Krasovskii Functional	51
3.8 The Normal Form Theorem and the Center Manifold Theorem (CMT)	53
<b>CHAPTER FOUR: RESULTS AND DISCUSSION OF MODELS</b>	<b>62</b>
4.1 Introduction	62
4.2 Single Species Delay Independent Population Model with Harvesting Function	62
4.2.1 Basic Properties of the Model	63
4.2.2 Stability Analysis of Trivial Equilibrium and Local Hopf Bifurcations	64
4.2.3 Positive Equilibrium Analysis of the Model (4.1)	70
4.3 Single Species Delay Dependent Population Model Function	76
4.3.1 Stability Analysis of Nicholson's Blowflies Model with Linear Harvesting Function	76
4.3.2 Basic Properties of Model (4.34)	77
4.3.3 Positivity and Boundedness of Solutions of Model (4.34)	77
4.3.4 Stability Analysis of Positive Equilibrium of the Delay Model	79
4.3.5 Hopf Bifurcation Analysis of Solutions of the Delay Model	81
4.3.6 Numerical Example of Stability of Positive Equilibrium	85
4.4 The Susceptible, Infectious and Recovered (SIR) Disease Model	88
4.4.1 The Mathematical Epidemic Model	88
4.4.2 Basic Assumptions of the Epidemic SIR Model	90
4.4.3 Positivity and Uniform Boundedness of Solutions of the Model	91

4.4.4	Stability Analysis of Model (4.50) without Delay	94
4.4.5	Stability Analysis of the Infectious (Endemic) Disease Without Delay	97
4.4.6	Numerical Example of Positive Equilibrium of the Infectious Disease Delay Model	105
4.5	The Reduced Epidemic Susceptible, Infectious and Recovered (SIR) Disease Model	106
4.5.1	The Reduced Epidemic Disease Model and the Center Manifold Theorem	107
4.5.2	Basic Assumptions of the Disease Epidemic Model	108
4.5.3	Basic Properties of the Model	109
4.5.4	Existence of Nonnegative Variables	109
4.5.5	Positivity and Uniform Boundedness of Solutions of the Model	110
4.5.6	Stability Analysis of DFE Model (4.70) With and Without Delay	112
4.6	The Popular Reproduction Number $R_0$	114
4.6.1	Analysis of DFE at $R_0 = 1$ for Model (4.70)	118
4.6.2	Stability Analysis of Endemic Disease with and Without Delay	122
4.6.3	Hopf Bifurcation Analysis of Endemic Equilibrium of System (4.70)	125
4.6.4	The Reduced Center Manifold Theorem	130
4.6.5	Direction and Stability of Hopf bifurcation	130
4.6.6	Numerical Simulation of Systems (4.50) and (4.70)	151
<b>CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>		<b>157</b>
5.1	Introduction	157
5.2	Summary of Findings	157
5.3	Conclusion	159
5.4	Contributions to Knowledge	161
5.5	Recommendations	161
5.6	Limitations of the Study	162
5.7	Areas for Further Research	162
<b>REFERENCES</b>		<b>164</b>

## LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURES	LIST OF FIGURES	PAGES
4.1	Equilibrium at $x^*a$ (Stability occurs for $\tau < \tau_c$ )	85
4.2	Equilibrium at $x^*b$ (Stability occurs for $\tau < \tau_c$ )	86
4.3	Equilibrium at $x^*c$ (Hopf bifurcation occurs for $\tau = \tau_c$ )	86
4.4	Equilibrium at $x^*d$ (Hopf bifurcation occurs for $\tau = \tau_c$ )	86
4.5	Equilibrium at $x^*e$ (chaotic or aperiodic patterns occur for $\tau > \tau_c$ )	87
4.6	Equilibrium at $x^*f$ (chaotic or aperiodic patterns occur for $\tau > \tau_c$ )	87
4.7	Block diagram of system (4.50) (Arya <i>et al.</i> , 2022)	90
4.8	Stability occurs at $\bar{\tau} = \tau_c = 1.3 < 1.95$ (DDE) model	106
4.9	Hopf bifurcation for $\bar{\tau} = \tau_c = 1.951$	107
4.10	Aperiodic pattern for $\tau > \tau_k$ ( $2.5 > 1.951$ )	107
4.11	Block diagram of system (4.70) (Arya <i>et al.</i> , 2022)	108
4.12	For $\tau = 0$ , the system (4.50) is asymptotically stable	152
4.13	For $R(t) = N(t) - S(t) - I(t)$ and $\tau = 0$ , (4.70) is asymptotically stable	152
4.14	For $\tau = 1.5 < \tau_k = 1.9510$ , the system (4.50) is asymptotically stable	152
4.15	For $R(t) = N(t) - S(t) - I(t)$ at $\bar{\tau} = 1.5 < \tau_c = 1.9510$ , system (4.70) is asymptotically stable	153
4.16	When $\tau = 1.9510 = \tau_c$ , the system (4.50) bifurcates at $\tau = \tau_c$	153
4.17	For constant variables and $\tau = \tau_c = 1.9510$ , the system (4.70) bifurcates at $\tau = \tau_c$	153
4.18	For $\tau > \tau_c$ <i>i.e.</i> ( $2.5 > 1.9510$ ), the system (4.50) is chaotic	154
4.19	For $\tau > \tau_c$ <i>i.e.</i> ( $2.5 > 1.9510$ ), the unstable system (4.750) is aperiodic	154
4.20	For $\tau = 0$ , the trivial solution of (4.50) of the ODE is asymptotically stable	154
4.21	For $\tau < \tau_c$ <i>i.e.</i> ( $1.5 < 1.9510$ ), the positive solution of the DDE of (4.50) is asymptotically stable	155
4.22	For $\tau = 0$ , the ODE of system (4.70) is asymptotically stable	155
4.23	For $\tau < \tau_c$ <i>i.e.</i> ( $1.5 < 1.9510$ ), the DDE of (4.70) is asymptotically stable	155
4.24	The DDE of (4.50) bifurcates at $\tau = \tau_c$	156

## LIST OF SYMBOLS

$\mathbb{R}^n$	n-tuples of real numbers
$C([- \tau, 0], \mathbb{R}^n)$	Space of continuous functions
Dim	Dimension
Ker	Kernel
Im	Image
Deg	Degree
$\subset$	Proper subset of
$\cap$	Intersection
$\cup$	Union
$\bar{\Omega}$	Closure of $\Omega$
$\partial\Omega$	Boundary of $\Omega$
Ind	Index
Coker	Co kernel
$\in$	is a member of or belongs to
$\forall$	for all
$\exists$	There exists
$\  \cdot \ $	Norm
$L^1[0, \infty)$	$L^1$ function space
$\mathbb{Z}$	The set of integers
$\mathbb{N}$	The set of natural numbers
$\mathbb{R}$	The set of real numbers
$\mathbb{C}$	The set of complex numbers
$Re(\lambda)$	The real part of $\lambda$ for $\lambda \in \mathbb{C}$
$Im(\lambda)$	The imaginary part of $\lambda$ for $\lambda \in \mathbb{C}$
$\mathbb{C}_0$	The set $\{\lambda \in \mathbb{C}: Re(\lambda) = 0\}$

$\mathbb{C}_+$             The set  $\{\lambda \in \mathbb{C}: \operatorname{Re}(\lambda) > 0\}$   
 $\mathbb{C}_-$             The set  $\{\lambda \in \mathbb{C}: \operatorname{Re}(\lambda) < 0\}$

## ABBREVIATIONS

<i>a.e.</i>	almost every
BVP	Boundary Value Problem
CMT	Center Manifold Theorem
DDEs	Delay Differential Equations
DIEs	Differential Integral Equations
DFEs	Delay Functional Equations
FDEs	Functional Differential Equations
FDDEs	Functional Delay Differential Equations
ivc	Initial value conditions
$O_p$ DE	Operator differential equation
ODEs	Ordinary Differential Equations
RFDEs	Retarded Functional Differential Equations
n.d.	negative definite
n.s.d.	negative semi definite
p.d.	positive definite
p.s.d.	positive semi definite

## ABSTRACT

This thesis studied differential equation models in mathematical biology with finite discrete delays for the stability of the linearised systems. It investigated the dynamical behaviour of the more general single species delay independent and delay dependent models with linear harvesting functions of delayed estimate of the true population. The study equally investigated the dynamical behaviour of susceptible ( $S$ ), infectious ( $I$ ) and recovered ( $R$ ) ( $SIR$ ) disease epidemic model with intra cellular delay. The study employed the characteristics and bifurcation techniques for the analysis of the linearised system for determining conditions for stability and instability of the systems. The normal form theory and the center manifold theorem (CMT) were employed for stability analysis where linearisation method does not apply. The popular reproduction number  $R_0$  for the disease free equilibrium (DFE) was further used to determine conditions under which the center manifold can be applied while using the threshold theorem of epidemiology to determine conditions for stability analysis. The results of the single species delay population models showed that a sequence of Hopf bifurcations occurred when the bifurcation parameters crossed some critical values. The critical positive delay periodic solutions guaranteed the existence of the critical value,  $\bar{\tau}$  from which the threshold theorem of epidemiology can be determined. If  $\tau \in [0, \bar{\tau})$ , the positive equilibrium of the models keeps a steady state. As the delay  $\bar{\tau}$  varies, some  $\bar{\tau} = \tau_k, k = 1, 2, \dots$  of the positive equilibrium become unstable and Hopf bifurcations occur. The conditions of Hopf bifurcations were sufficient and chaotic phenomenon appeared when model maturation delays are large. However, conditions for local stability of equilibria were found in the disease epidemic equation models using the reproduction number,  $R_0$ . It was observed that the positive equilibrium  $E^*$  is locally stable when  $R_0 < 1$ , which indicates that the infection is no longer present in the population. It is also noted that  $E^*$  is unstable when  $R_0 > 1$  and this indicates that the infection exists in the system. Using the CMT, it was observed that when  $R_0 = 1$  the decoupled disease epidemic system undergoes forward bifurcation. In particular, the results of the disease epidemic models showed that the conditions for bifurcations obtained from the behavior of the dynamical systems are sufficient but not necessary as the models were unable to stabilise the unstable interior non hyperbolic equilibrium due to Hopf bifurcations. Specifically, the direction of Hopf bifurcations, stability and the period of the bifurcating periodic solutions of the non hyperbolic disease reduced model were explicitly determined by applying the normal form concept and the center manifold reduction theorem to the perturbed operator differential equation (OPDE) where the linearised equation has at least one characteristic root with zero real part while every other eigenvalue has negative real part. To ensure model relevance, the study is recommended to ecologists, biologists and public health workers. Finally, numerical simulations to verify the analytically findings in support of stability for both population and disease epidemic models were performed using MATLAB software and Pic Wish Version 1.5.6.

**Keywords:** *Center Manifold theorem; Characteristic equation; Hopf bifurcation; Jacobian matrix; Lyapunov functional; Stability analysis; Time delay.*