RELIABILITY AND CONSISTENCY OF THE INVESTMENT METHOD OF VALUATION: A STUDY OF LAGOS METROPOLIS

By

AYEDUN CALEB ABIODUN (Reg. No CU03GP0014)

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE DEPARTMENT OF ESTATE MANAGEMENT, COLLEGE OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE AWARD OF THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY (PhD)

IN ESTATE MANAGEMENT

COVENANT UNIVERSITY,

OTA, OGUN STATE, NIGERIA

APRIL, 2009

DEDICATION

This work is dedicated

To

My Late Father - Chief Gabriel Abon Ayedun

And

My Mother – Mrs. Florence Oretipe Ayedun

For their unforgettable efforts at affording to send me to school Inspite of their inadequacies and laying the foundation of what am today.

CERTIFICATION

| This is to certify that MR. A YEDUN Caleb Ablodun (Reg. No. C003Gl | P0014) C | arried | out thi | S |
|---|----------|--------|---------|---|
| research work in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the award of | f Doctor | of Ph | ilosoph | y |
| (PhD) in Estate Management of Covenant University, Ota under my super | rvision. | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |
| | | | | |

| Dr. O.A. Ogunba | Date |
|-------------------|------|
| | |
| | |
| | |
| Dr. S. A. Oloyede | Date |

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I wish to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor in person of Dr. O.A. Ogunba for his support, efforts and immeasurable contributions to my successful completion of this study. I am very much grateful for his brotherly love and perseverance in guiding me to accomplish this study. I am bold to say that you are a Christian in indeed.

I also wish to acknowledge the wonderful assistance and support given to me by Dr. S.A. Oloyedemy Co-Supervisor. Dr. Oloyede is an epitome of love and a pillar of support to me in accomplishing this project. He was always there for me any time I ran into brickwork in the

course of doing the project to bail me out. I equally wish to acknowledge the wonderful cooperation and love extended to me by her wonderful and lovely wife for being magnanimous enough to always accommodate me in their official quarters within the campus on those days I have to sleep over in the campus.

I equally acknowledged the esteemed support and encouragement of Professor Cyril Ayedele Ajayi for persistently asking about my progress of work throughout the period of the study.

In addition, Professor A.S. Asaju deserves a special attention for his contributions and subtle pressures often mounted on all members of staff in the department undergoing PhD works. You can be sure that any time he comes to the office in the morning that he will not fail to visit each of us in our different offices to ask after our progress regarding our research works. Similarly, I appreciate the pressure, in diverse ways, mounted on me by my colleagues in the department including Messrs Durodola, Omoogun, Ajibola, Oni, Simon Funso, Iroham and Mrs. Oluwunmithroughout the research exercise. They all kept asking me about my progress. I must confess that your concern about my completion of the project indeed serve as the mostly needed tonic to complete the research. I really appreciate your concern and love for me.

I wish to acknowledge the contributions of Messrs Tayo Ogunsanya and Idowu Aladeloye both of Lagos State Development and Property Corporation for their efforts in assisting in administering the questionnaires meant for Property Development companies. May God bless and prosper you and the works of your hands.

I also wish to recognize and appreciate the Chancellor of Covenant University, Dr. David Oyeniyi Oyedepo who God used to establish the university and in turn gave me the rare opportunity to achieve one of my life desire of becoming PhD holder. I will not also fail to recognize some of the instruments God used along the line to accomplish the task of becoming PhD holder. They include the pioneer Vice Chancellor of the University, Professor Bola Ayeni, Professor Prince Famous Izedomi the Pioneer dean of College Business and Social Science who taught us the very first lecture. I equally wish to express my unreserved appreciation to the pioneer Dean of College of Science and Technology, Professor Ibiyemi for his word of encouragement. I sincerely want to appreciate the following set of people for their contributions toward the completion of this thesis. They include the current Vice Chancellor Professor Aize Obayan and pioneer Registrar, Deacon Yemi Nathaniel as well as the current Registrar, Dr. Daniel Rotimi. May the good Lord continue to strengthen you to continue the good work you are doing.

I also wish to place on record the contributions and support received from Messrs Sola Ajibade, Ayo Akinwale and Steve Ahkigbemidu of UAPDC. I appreciate the encouragements received from Dr. Ayo Olajuyigbe of Federal University of Technology, Akure, Dr. G.K. Babawal and Dr. K.T. Odusami both of University of Lagos, Akoka. I also wish to appreciate Dr. Gbadebo Adejumo of Covenant University, Ota and Mr. O.O. Olufolabo, the Head of Department of Statistics, Yaba College of Technology, lagos with respect to data analysis.

I want to acknowledge the assistance of Mr. Babatunde Oyewo a 2007/2008 graduate of the Department of Estate Management who assisted me in securing data relating to Federal Government landed properties sold in 2007. In the same vein, I want to register my appreciation to Miss Bukola Oladipupo another member of 2007/2008 final year student of the Department of Estate Management who took pain to assist me in extracting some of the vital data used in the study.

I will not fail to appreciate the support and concern of my immediate brothers and sisters that kept on encouraging me throughout the course of doing the research work. They include Mrs. B.B. Seweje, Dr. Ayodele Abel Ayedun (USA); Mr. Bode Ayedun, Mrs. Adewale Faokunla, Mr

Sunday Ayedun, Rev. Ojoose Ayedun and Mrs. Funmilayo Alu. They were always there for while the programme lasted. May God bless and prosper you all.

I hereby express my indebtedness to authors of professional papers, journal articles, seminar papers, textbooks, etc., whose ideas form the main thrust and useful reference points for this thesis.

Finally, I deeply appreciate my lovely wife, Elisabeth Olusola Ayedun for her support and efficient management of the home front while the programme lasted. I am indeed grateful to her and to my children including Oluwatoyosi, Oluwamayowa and Oluwaseyi Ayedun for their understanding, prayers and support. The research took much of my time working round the clock all in a bid to complete the work as a result of which I did not have enough time to spend with them. I sincerely appreciate their understanding and unwavering support. I pray that the loving spirit reigning in the family will continue to soar in Jesus name (Amen).

Above all, I give glory to God Almighty for giving me the grace to complete the study successfully.

COVENANT UNIVERSITY, OTA, NIGERIA

CENTRE FOR LEARNING RESOURCES

POSTGRADUATE THESIS

AUTHORIZATION TO COPY

| AUTHOR | 2: AYEDUN Caleb Abiodun |
|--------------|---|
| TITLE: | Reliability and Consistency of the Investment Method of Valuation: • A Study of Lagos Metropolis |
| DEGREE | : Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in Estate Management |
| YEAR: | 2009 |
| Resour | OUN, Caleb Abiodun hereby authorize Center for Learning ces to copy my thesis in part or whole in response to request dividuals and or organizations for the purpose of private study arch. |
| Date | Signature |

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| Title Page | i | |
|--|------|---|
| Dedication | ii | |
| Certification of Supervisor | iii | |
| Acknowledgement | iv | |
| Authorization to Copy | viii | |
| Table of Contents | ix | |
| List of Tables | | |
| List of Figures | | |
| Abstract | | |
| CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION | 1 | |
| 1. Background to the Study | 1 | |
| 2. Statement of the Research Problem | 2 | |
| 3. Aim and Objectives of the Study | 5 | |
| 4. Significance of Study | 6 | |
| 1.5 Scope of the Study | 7 | |
| 1.6 The Study Area | | 8 |
| 1.7 Definition of Key Terms | 9 | |
| 1.7 Limitations of the Study | 11 | |
| 1.8 Plan of Study | 12 | |
| 1.9 Chapter Summary | 13 | |
| | | |
| CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW | 14 | |
| 2.1 Introduction | 14 | |
| 2.2. Benchmarking Valuation Accuracy | 14 | |
| 2.3 Empirical Valuation Accuracy Studies in the United Kingdom. | 18 | |
| 2.4 Empirical Valuation Accuracy Studies in the USA | 22 | |
| 5. Valuation Accuracy Studies in Australia | 23 | |
| 2.6 Valuation Accuracy Studies in Nigeria. | 24 | |
| 2.7 Observed Gaps/Limitations in the Previous Accuracy/Variation Studies | 27 | |
| 2.8 Behavioural Research into Valuation Accuracy | 29 | |

| 9. Client Influence in Valuation Accuracy | 32 |
|--|----|
| 2.10 Types of Influence Adopted by Clients | 40 |
| 2.11 Chapter Summary | 41 |
| CHAPTER THREE: THE CONCEPT | 43 |
| 1. Introduction | 43 |
| 3.2 Expectations on Maximum Acceptable Margin of Error | 44 |
| 3.3 Expectations on Accuracy and Variance | 45 |
| 3.4 Behavioural and Other Causes of Valuation Accuracy and Variance. | 47 |
| 3.5 Models of Client Influence on Valuation Accuracy. | 56 |
| 3.6 Summary and Modeling of Research Concept | 64 |
| 3.7 A-Priori Expectations. | 68 |
| 3.8 Chapter Summary | 69 |
| CHAPTER FOUR: METHODOLOGY | 70 |
| 4.1 Introduction | 70 |
| 4.2 Choice of Methodological Approach | 70 |
| 4.3 Study Populations and Data Requirements | 73 |
| 4.4 Sample Frames | 74 |
| 5. Method of Sampling | 74 |
| 6. Sample Size | 75 |
| 4.7 Data Collection Instruments | 76 |
| 4.8 Questionnaire Design | 78 |
| 4.9 Techniques of Measuring A-Priori Expectations | 80 |
| 10. Methods of Data Analysis. | 82 |
| 11. Chapter Summary | 87 |
| CHAPTER FIVE: PRESENTATION AND INTERPRETATION OF DATA | 88 |

| 5.1 Introduction | 88 | |
|--|-------------------|-----|
| 5.2 Preliminary Survey Details | 89 | |
| 5.3 Profile of Respondents | 90 | |
| 5.3.1 Profile of Estate Surveyors and Valuers | 90 | |
| 5.3.1.1 Response Rate According to Location | 90 | |
| 5.3.1.2 Estate Surveying and Valuation Firms' Areas of Specialization | 95 | |
| 5.3.2 Profile of Banks | 95 | |
| 5.3.3 Profile of Property Companies | 97 | |
| 5.4 Perceptions on Valuation Accuracy in Nigeria | 99 | |
| 5.5 Perception of Stakeholders on Liability for Valuation Inaccuracy in Nigeria | 100 | |
| 6. Examination of Variables in Investment Valuation | 102 | |
| 5.6.1 Methods of Determining Capitalization Rates by Estate Surveyors and | | |
| Valuers in Lagos Metropolis | 102 | |
| 5.6.2 Methods of Determining Gross Rental Incomes for Investment | | |
| Valuations by the Estate Surveyors and Valuers in Lagos Metropolis | 103 | |
| 5.6.3 Methods of Determining Outgoings Deduction from the Gross | | |
| Rents for Investment Valuation Purpose | 104 | |
| 5.7 Client Influence on the Valuation Process | 104 | |
| 5.7.1 Sources of Client Influence | | |
| 5.7.2 Mode of Influence Adopted by Clients | 108 | |
| 5.8 Testing of the A-Priori Expectations | 112 | |
| 5.19 Assessment of Valuation Estimate Accuracy on | | |
| Federal Government Properties Sold in 2007 in Lagos State | | 126 |
| 5.15 Causes of Inaccuracy/Inconsistency in the Conduct of Valuation5.15.1 Capitalization Rates Applied by Respondents5.15.2 Gross Income (Rent) Applied by Respondents | 129 129 130 | |

| 5.15.3 Rate of Outgoings Adopted for the valuations5.16 Chapter Summary | 131 133 |
|---|------------|
| CHAPTER SIX: RESULTS AND DISCUSSION 6.1 Introduction 1. Ascertaining the perception of Stakeholders maximum | 135 135 |
| Acceptable Margin of Error of Valuation | 135 |
| 2. Examination of how Valuation Estimates of one firm | |
| proxy Valuation Estimates of other firms | 136 |
| 6.2.3 Examination of how Valuation Estimates proxy open | |
| market sale prices of real properties | 137 |
| 6.2.4 Identification and examination of clients' influence | |
| and its effects on valuation estimates | 137 |
| 6.5 Chapter Summary CHAPTER SEVEN: SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUDING REMARKS | 139 140 |
| 7.1 Introduction | 140 |
| 7.2 Summary of Findings | 140 |
| 7.3 Recommendations | 142 |
| 7.4 Opportunities for Further Research | 145 |
| 7.5 Concluding Remarks | 146 |
| REFERENCES | 147 |
| Appendix I | |
| Appendix II | |
| Appendix III | |
| Appendix IV | |

LIST OF TABLES

| Table | litle | Page |
|-------|--|------|
| | 1. Summary Details of 12 Sampled Properties | 79 |
| | 2. Techniques of Data Analysis for A- Priori Expectations | 82 |
| 5.1 | Distribution of Questionnaires to Valuation Stakeholders | 89 |
| 5.2 | Questionnaire Distribution to Valuers by Location | 91 |
| 5.3 | General Characteristics of Respondent Estate Surveyors and Valuers | 93 |
| 5.4 | Respondent's Firm's Area of Specialization | 95 |
| 5.5 | Bio-Data of Respondent Bank Officials | 96 |
| 5.6 | Bio-Data of Property Companies' Respondents | 97 |
| 5.7 | Analysis of Property Companies | 98 |
| 5.8 | Perceptions of Respondents on Valuation Accuracy in | |
| | Nigeria (Relative Importance Indices) | 100 |
| 5.9 | Perceptions of Valuation Stakeholders on the Degree | |
| | of Variances/Inconsistencies | 101 |
| 5.10 | Methods of Determining Capitalization Rates for Investment | |
| 3.10 | Methods of Determining Capitalization Rates for Investment | |
| | Valuation Purposes by Estate Surveyors and Valuers in Lagos | |
| | Metropolis | 102 |
| 5.11 | Methods of Determining Gross Rental Values for | |
| | Investment Valuation Purposes by Estate Surveyors | |
| | and Valuers in Lagos Metropolis. | 103 |
| | 12. Methods of Determining Outgoings Deductable from | |
| | Gross Rental Values for Investment Valuation | |
| | Purposes in Lagos Metropolis | 105 |
| 5.13 | Estate Surveyors and Valuers Experience of Client Influence | 107 |
| 5.14 | Clients in the habit of Influencing Valuers' Valuation Opinion | 108 |
| 5.15 | Frequency of Clients' Influence for Various Valuation Purposes | 109 |
| 5.16 | Frequency of Clients Influence on Valuation Estimates | 110 |
| 5.17 | Mode of Influence Often Adopted by Clients at | |
| | Influencing Valuation Estimates | 111 |
| 5.18: | Analysis of Variance Comparing Valuers, Courts and | |
| | Clients needs for Valuation accuracy | 112 |
| 5.19 | Mean for Stakeholders' Need for Accuracy and Margin of Error | 113 |
| 5.20 | ANOVA Summary of Difference between Placement, Performance | |
| | Appraisal and Organizational Performance | 114 |
| 5.21 | Mean of Margin of Error for All Stakeholders | 115 |
| | | |

| 5.22 | That the Acceptable Margin of Error among the Stakeholders | | |
|------|--|-----|--|
| | Should be $\pm 10\%$ | 115 | |
| 5.23 | Co-efficient | 117 | |
| 5.24 | Analysis of Variance | 117 | |
| 5.25 | Coefficients | 117 | |
| 5.26 | Analysis of Variance | 118 | |
| 5.27 | T-Test of Valuation Estimates and Market Prices | 119 | |
| 5.28 | Assessment of the Accuracy of Sampled Properties by | | |
| | Means of Several Tests | 120 | |
| 5.29 | Cumulative Margins of Error among 45 Valuers in Lagos | 121 | |
| 5.30 | Assessment of Consistency/Variance among the 45 Valuers | | |
| | in Respect of Sampled Properties by Means of Several Tests | 124 | |
| 5.31 | Deviation from Mean Valuation Estimates by 45 Valuers in Lagos | 125 | |
| 5.32 | Federal Government Landed Properties Recently Sold | | |
| | in Lagos State Locations | 126 | |
| 5.33 | Federal Government Landed Properties Recently Sold in | | |
| | Lagos State by Street Locations | 127 | |
| 3 | 4. Cumulative Margin of Error in Respect of 131 Federal | | |
| | Government Privatized Properties in Lagos State | 128 | |
| 5.35 | Capitalization Rates Adopted in the Valuation of Sampled | | |
| | Properties by 45 Valuers | 129 | |
| 5.36 | Gross Rental Incomes Adopted For the Valuation of the 12 | | |
| | Sampled Properties by the 45 Respondent Valuers | 130 | |
| | 37. Rates of Outgoings Adopted For the Valuation of the 12 Sampled | | |
| | Properties by the 45 Respondent Valuers | 132 | |
| 6.1 | Identified Clients' Modes of Influence on Valuation estimates | 138 | |

LIST OF FIGURES

| Figure | Title | Page |
|--------|--|------|
| 2.1 | Valuation within the Commercial Environment | 37 |
| 3.1 | Structure-Conduct Performance Model | 48 |
| 3.2 | Model of factors responsible for inaccurate valuations | 50 |
| 3.3 | Model of factors affecting Valuation Accuracy | 53 |
| 3.4 | Model of Heuristic Influences on Valuation Accuracy | 55 |
| 3.5 | Model of Client Influence Factors affecting Valuation Accuracy | 58 |
| 3.6 | The Author's Concept of Factors Intensifying Client Influence | |
| | On Valuations | 60 |
| 3.7 | Valuation Accuracy and Consistency Determinant Model | 65 |

ABSTRACT

Against the recent increasing criticism against the reliability and consistency of investment method of valuation practice in the country, this study examined the professional ability of estate surveyors and valuers at interpreting the selling prices of residential properties in the open market in the Lagos metropolis with a view to

either invalidate or validate the claim.

In an attempt to satisfy the objective of the study, questionnaires backed up with interviews, were administered on a sample of randomly selected 127 estate surveying and valuation firms out of the 228 registered firms in Lagos Metropolis while questionnaires equally backed up with interviews were also administered on a sample size of 91 randomly selected property companies out of 137 identified institutional property companies obtained from the directory of real estate business operating within the study area and the entire 25 commercial banks operating in Lagos metropolitan area. Secondary data of the valuation estimates and sale prices of Federal Government landed properties sold in 2006 were obtained from Ad hoc committee set for the purpose and Nigeria Punch newspaper of 5th February, 2007. Data obtained were analyzed with the use of parametric and non-parametric statistics consisting of frequency distribution, range, interquartile range, mean, mean deviation from market price, standard deviation and regression analysis.

The result of all the statistical tests revealed firstly, that valuation estimates were not a good proxy for transaction market prices and secondly, that valuation estimates of one firm not good proxy for contemporaneous valuations of other firms in Lagos.

Client influence was identified to have had negative impact on valuation outcome. The study also revealed that various inputs used for investment valuations are not market derived and this phenomenon could account for valuation inaccuracy and inconsistency. Also, the study revealed that valuers in Lagos metropolis do not have a standardized approach to determination of valuation inputs and this could account largely for lack of consistency amongst the valuers and moreover there is problem of lack of up-to-date property databank to assist the valuers in determining the inputs to use for investment valuation assignments.

Conclusions from the study are that investment method of valuation as currently used is not properly applied in Lagos metropolis, hence has failed to produce valuation estimates that could serve as good proxies for both market sale transaction prices and contemporaneous valuations of other firms. The ranges obtained for all the twelve sample properties were higher than the acceptable range of $\pm 10\%$ adopted for this study.

Following from the foregoing, the study recommended among other suggestions maintenance of up-to-date property databank by both national and state chapters of Nigerian Institution of Estate Surveyors and Valuers, review of valuation Guidance Notes to ensure greater uniformity in approach and accuracy of investment valuations from the valuers/.